# USA Math Outcomes Analysis 2021/22 

Grade Levels: 3, 4, 5<br>ST Math Program: Gen-6<br>Analysis Type: Z-score of Math Proficiency<br>Treatment-Years: 2020/21 and 2021/22<br>Baseline-Year: 2018/19<br>Subgroup: All

## Jessica Guise

(C) 2024-02-05

## Abstract

This analysis evaluates grades using ST Math in the USA in 2021/22. It identifies those grades with nominal or better implementation of the ST Math program, and matches them to randomly selected, similar math-performance comparison grades. The nominal ST Math users are an aggregation of 320 grades, consisting of grades 3,4 , and 5 at 173 schools, with an average baseline $z$-score of -0.23 . Refer to Figures 2 and 3 for the math performance and demographic distributions. They were matched to 320 similar, randomly selected control grades at 280 schools that never used ST Math. Grade-wise growth in math proficiency was evaluated (i.e. growth in same grade, same school, from 2018/19 to 2021/22) on the mean $z$-scores of percent Proficient or Advanced (see Section 3.1). Grades 3, 4, and 5 aggregated showed an ST Math effect of 0.22 z-score points.

## Contents

1 Introduction ..... 5
1.1 Background ..... 5
1.2 Program Description ..... 5
2 Data Collection ..... 6
2.1 Treatment Grades Pool and Selection ..... 6
2.1.1 Enrollment Filter ..... 6
2.1.2 Content Coverage Filter ..... 6
2.2 Control Grades Pool and Selection ..... 6
3 Data Analysis ..... 7
3.1 Z-scores ..... 7
3.2 Percentile Ranking ..... 7
3.3 Final Treatment and Control ..... 8
3.3.1 ST Math Grade-Aggregated Implementation ( $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment Grades Only) ..... 8
3.3.2 Filtering Treatment and Controls ..... 9
3.3.3 Match of Controls to Treatment ..... 10
3.4 Grade-Aggregated Analysis ..... 11
3.5 Grade-Level Analysis ..... 13
3.5.1 Grade Level Result Tables ..... 13
3.5.2 Grade-Level Analysis of Changes in Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced ..... 14
4 Effect Size ..... 15
5 Findings Summary ..... 15
6 Confounders ..... 15
7 Lists of Schools ..... 16
7.1 Treatment Schools ..... 16
7.2 Control Schools ..... 19

## List of Figures

1 Histogram of ST Math Percent Progress for $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment Grades 2021/22 ..... 8
2 Baseline Year Density Plots Showing Math Scores and Percent Student Need Match between TRT and CTRL - 2018/19 ..... 10
3 Changes in Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced (See Section 3.1) for Grade-Aggregated TRT and CTRL datasets between 2018/19 and 2021/22 ..... 11
4 Changes in Percentile Ranking for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2018/19 and 2021/22 ..... 12
5 Changes in Grade-Mean Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced (See Section 3.1) for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2018/19 and 2021/22 ..... 14

## List of Tables

1 Descriptive Statistics of ST Math Percent Progress for $>=85$ percent Enrollment Grades ..... 8
2 Number of ST Math Grades with $>=85$ percent Enrollment and with $>=40$ percent progress ..... 8
3 Treatment Pool Filtering and Controls: Counts of Grades, Schools, and Students ..... 9
4 Matching TRT and CTRL ..... 10
5 All Grades Together Growth ..... 11
6 Statistics for the Differential Changes in Math Scores Growth (TRT - CTRL) ..... 12
7 Grade 3 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets ..... 13
8 Grade 4 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets ..... 13
9 Grade 5 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets ..... 13
10 Statistics for the Differential Changes in Z-scores (See Section 3.1) Growth, (TRT - CTRL) ..... 14
11 Cohen's d Effect Size ..... 15
12 Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset) ..... 16
13 Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset) ..... 17
14 Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset) ..... 18
15 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 19
16 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 20
17 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 21
18 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 22
19 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 23

## 1 Introduction

### 1.1 Background

This is a quasi-experimental analysis at the grade-mean level. Entire grades represent the units of analysis, and outcome measures are the 2 -year changes in grade-mean z-score of Proficient or Advanced. The treatment grades used the ST Math program for 2 years, beginning in the 2020/21 school year. The study hypothesis is treatment grades using ST Math will outperform similar matched control grades, using their "business as usual" conditions of instructional content and professional development. The control grades were selected to have similar demographic and math attributes (See Figures 2 and 3) to the treatment grades during the baseline year (2018/19), and did not use ST Math in any subsequent year. The treatment grades' selection pool was all schools using ST Math in grades 3, 4, and 5 in the USA. The control grades' pool was all schools not using ST Math in grades 3, 4, and 5 in the USA. This study method measures effectiveness of the ST Math program when nominally implemented.

### 1.2 Program Description

Spatial-Temporal Math (ST Math) is game-based, instructional software for K-12 students, created by the MIND Research Institute (MIND). The purpose of the program is to boost math comprehension through visual learning. The ST Math software games begin without language or symbol abstractions by posing math problems as purely visual puzzles. In this way, three objectives are accomplished: i) language proficiency prerequisites to engage with the program are minimal, ii) non-mathematical distractions (e.g. back-stories for word problems) are minimized or eliminated - thereby reducing load on working memory, and iii) the actual math in the problem can be represented clearly, simply, and unambiguously. Interactive, animated visual manipulatives provide informative feedback on student solutions. A score of 100 percent on a game level comprised of 4-12 puzzles is required for progression through the levels. Failure requires a re-play of the level, via a new quasi-random set of puzzles. In this way, progression is self-paced.

Besides the self-paced progress made by students in their one-to-one environment, the program is designed to be referenced by teachers during their regular math instruction. It is supplemental to core or basal math instruction and instructional materials. As the great majority of grade-level math standards are covered in the ST Math digital curriculum, completion of $100 \%$ of the entire ST Math curriculum (i.e. completing every Game) is required to cover all grade-level math standards. Teachers receive initial training, either face to face or through self-guided online instruction. The training covers account startup, as well as math learning and growth mindset goals, the pedagogical approach to learning in a visual experiential game, monitoring and intervention of the student 1:1 game play, and connecting of ST Math content to classroom content and pacing.

For students to achieve nominal progress through the program, there is a recommended time-on-task requirement of 90 minutes per week over about 30 weeks. Consistent application of 90 minutes per week throughout the school year is normally sufficient to result in a grade's average ST Math content coverage exceeding $50 \%$ by year-end. In this study, we include grades that have achieved $40 \%$ or more content coverage (Progress) by April 15th.

This is a passive study with no experimental setup or extraordinary communications to any schools. All schools in this study therefore received normal program implementation support through the year from MIND support managers. This support includes bundled startup services of approximately 2-4 hours of training either in-person or online, access to live webinars, regular online and push reports on usage and progress, email/phone helpdesk, and proactive monitoring for gaps or issues by MIND support representatives.

MIND Research Institute initiated, funded, and exercised editorial control over this study.

## 2 Data Collection

Since this analysis uses grades as the unit of analysis, and states publish grade-mean state standardized test scores, the data for student math outcomes is collected from each state education agency's research files (retrieved from state websites). The treatment students use ST Math student accounts served by MIND. Student ST Math usage data is aggregated to grade-level means by MIND.

### 2.1 Treatment Grades Pool and Selection

The Treatment grades pool originated with all schools and grades using ST Math in the USA. From these schools, every grade that had used the ST Math program in 2020/21 and 2021/22 was identified. They comprise the Treatment grades pool for this evaluation of 2-year usage.

### 2.1.1 Enrollment Filter

Because the analysis uses grade-mean data, such as grade-mean scale scores or grade-mean proficiency level percentages, it is necessary that the program also be a grade-wide treatment, with the great majority of students in each grade receiving treatment. Otherwise, the grade-means reported by the state of $100 \%$ of tested students would not be valid measures of a smaller fraction of treatment students. MIND's site implementation requirement is that an entire grade, including all teachers and all classes within that grade, use the ST Math program. We validate how closely this is the case for each individual treatment grade by comparing the number of ST Math student accounts at a grade level to the reported enrollment at that grade level. We discard from the Treatment pool any grade with a ratio of ST Math student accounts to reported grade enrollment lower than $85 \%$.

### 2.1.2 Content Coverage Filter

Furthermore, the outcomes measure is a summative year-end test, i.e. the standardized math assessment of that state. The math assessment thus covers all the math standards for that entire grade level. Meanwhile, the ST Math program curriculum (arranged into Learning Objectives) is also aligned to each state's math standards. To infer that the ST Math content is having a valid effect on student outcomes on the summative assessment, we discard any grade with grade-mean of ST Math Progress for its students lower than $40 \%$ by April.

Progress is a percentage, and is defined as Levels completed by the student, divided by the total number of Levels in the grade-level curriculum. Note that student achievement of at least $40 \%$ progress in ST Math is accomplished primarily by teacher assignment of computer session time to students. With sufficient time on task, students make progress. The program helps them self-pace through providing real-time informative feedback for each puzzle.

### 2.2 Control Grades Pool and Selection

The control grades are randomly selected from a control pool of schools in the USA. Though they are randomly selected, they are also matched to be similar to the Treatment grades' math attributes and demographics during the baseline 2018/19 year. The matched attributes include:

- grade-mean z-score of percent Proficient or Advanced
- percentage of students receiving free or reduced lunch at the school-level (using the demographic data from MDR).

The method of matching used is propensity score matching, via the "matchit" program in R, with "mahalanobis" as the distance measure.

## 3 Data Analysis

The set of all schools and grades using ST Math in the USA is evaluated for Enrollment percentage and Progress percentage parameters. A filtered Treatment set (TRT) of all ST Math grades with $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment and $\geq 40 \%$ Progress is identified. State math assessment data is tabulated. A matching set of Control grades based on baseline year state math assessment is selected.

Changes in math performance, i.e. the difference in math performance of a grade from a baseline year to the final year, are evaluated and tabulated. Statistical tests of the significance of the difference in math performance changes between Treatment grades and Control grades are performed. Finally, a grade-by-grade disaggregation is performed.

### 3.1 Z-scores

In order to analyze across all states with different math assessments, a new z-score of that test's math proficiency is calculated. For each year being analyzed, by grade, a z-score takes the difference of the grade mean percent proficient and the mean of all percent proficient statewide for that year, and then divides it by the standard deviation of all percent proficient statewide for that year. Here is a fictional example to illustrate the calculation of a z-score for the 2015/16 exam:

School A, Grade 3, Percent Proficient: 70
Average across all schools statewide, Grade 3: 50
Standard deviation across all schools statewide, Grade 3: 20
Z-score $=(($ School A, Grade 3, Percent Proficient)-(Average across all schools, Grade 3))/(Standard deviation across all schools, Grade 3)

$$
\text { Z-score }=\frac{70-50}{20}=1
$$

The z-score is calculated for every grade across all years being analyzed, using the full state data set of schools for the averages and standard deviations. The use of $z$-scores is a valid statistical method to normalize any dataset and to enable analysis across otherwise uncomparable exams. In this report, we only analyze z-scores.

### 3.2 Percentile Ranking

These newly calculated z-scores can then be converted into a percentile ranking. Each percentile ranking shows the grade's performance relative to the others in that year and grade. For example, for a specific grade 3, a percentile ranking of 50 shows that this grade 3 performed at the average of all third grades in the state for that testing year.

### 3.3 Final Treatment and Control

### 3.3.1 ST Math Grade-Aggregated Implementation ( $\geq \mathbf{8 5 \%}$ Enrollment Grades Only)

ST Math Percent Grade Mean Progress Distribution - 2021/22


Figure 1: Histogram of ST Math Percent Progress for $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment Grades 2021/22
For all ST Math grades with Enrollment $\geq 85 \%$, Figure 1 shows the frequency distribution of gradeaverage Progress percentage through the program. Note that we will only be using grades with $\geq 40 \%$ Progress as the Treatment Group.

Table 1 provides descriptive statistics of the Progress distribution. Table 2 shows the number of remaining treatment grades after applying enrollment and progress filters.

|  | Min. | Max. | Average | S.D. |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| ST Math \% Progress | 0.4 | 126.3 | 18.4 | 16.2 |

Table 1: Descriptive Statistics of ST Math Percent Progress for $>=85$ percent Enrollment Grades

| Grades with $>=85 \%$ Enrollment: | 2729 |
| ---: | ---: |
| Grades with in addition $>=40 \%$ Progress: | 320 |

Table 2: Number of ST Math Grades with $>=85$ percent Enrollment and with $>=40$ percent progress

### 3.3.2 Filtering Treatment and Controls

Table 3 shows the total number of grades in the Treatment pool, the number of grades that exceeded the $85 \%$ Enrollment figure, and also the $40 \%$ Progress filter. Other rows in the table indicate counts of numbers of students (2021/22 from state testing count) and counts of number of schools represented. The number of matched Control (CTRL) grades, students, and schools is also shown.

|  | Grade 3 | Grade 4 | Grade 5 | Total |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ST Math Using Grades | 1574 | 1549 | 1486 | 4609 |
| ST Math Using Schools | 1526 | 1506 | 1448 | 1806 |
| ST Math Students | 114539 | 117931 | 119452 | 351922 |
| ST Math Grades (Enroll $>=85 \%$ ) | 994 | 923 | 812 | 2729 |
| TRT Grades (Enroll $>=85 \%$ \& Prog $>=40 \%)$ | 115 | 116 | 89 | 320 |
| TRT Schools (Enroll $>=85 \%$ \& Prog $>=40 \%)$ | 115 | 116 | 89 | 173 |
| TRT Students (Enroll $>=85 \%$ \& Prog $>=40 \%)$ | 7834 | 8712 | 6535 | 23081 |
| CTRL Grades | 115 | 116 | 89 | 320 |
| CTRL Schools | 115 | 115 | 89 | 280 |
| CTRL Students | 7916 | 7440 | 6359 | 21715 |

Table 3: Treatment Pool Filtering and Controls: Counts of Grades, Schools, and Students

### 3.3.3 Match of Controls to Treatment

Figure 2 shows the density plots of the baseline $z$-score of percent students at state assessment Proficient or Advanced (left plot) and the percentage of students needing free or reduced lunch (right plot) for treatment grades overlayed on control grades, showing the closeness of the match obtained between Treatment and Control sets of grades in the baseline year, 2018/19.


Figure 2: Baseline Year Density Plots Showing Math Scores and Percent Student Need Match between TRT and CTRL - 2018/19

Table 4 shows the difference of the means of Treatment versus Control in the baseline year, with accompanying p-values, for mean z-score of percent Proficient or Advanced and for percent of students receiving free or reduced lunch. The large p-values show the differences between the Treatment and Control grades are not statistically significant.

|  | Mean(TRT) | SD(TRT) | Mean(CTRL) | SD(CTRL) | Estimate | P-Value | Effect Size |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced $-2018 / 19$ | -0.23 | 0.99 | -0.22 | 0.99 | -0.01 | 0.90 | -0.01 |
| Percent Free or Reduced Lunch | 45.78 | 24.83 | 45.52 | 24.67 | 0.26 | 0.89 | 0.01 |

Table 4: Matching TRT and CTRL

### 3.4 Grade-Aggregated Analysis

Table 5 shows for both Treatment (TRT) and Control (CTRL) aggregation across grades of z-score distributions. The far right column also shows the average ST Math Progress for the TRT set.

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Comp. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.18.19 | 320 | 173 | 23453 | -0.23 | 43.22 | - |
| TRT.21.22 | 320 | 173 | 21224 | 0.04 | 50.06 | 53.83 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.27 | 6.84 | - |
| CTRL.18.19 | 320 | 280 | 23467 | -0.22 | 43.56 | - |
| CTRL.21.22 | 320 | 280 | 21715 | -0.18 | 43.91 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | 0.04 | 0.35 | - |

Table 5: All Grades Together Growth
Figure 3 shows the changes in mean z-scores of percent Proficient or Advanced for the gradeaggregated Treatment and Control sets.


Figure 3: Changes in Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced (See Section 3.1) for Grade-Aggregated TRT and CTRL datasets between 2018/19 and 2021/22

Further, Table 6 shows the statistics for the differences in changes between TRT and CTRL (Treatment - Control) for these same z -score changes as in the above figure. ${ }^{1}$

|  | Estimate | P-Value | Int.Low | Int. High |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Z-Score | 0.22 | $0.00^{*}$ | 0.12 | 0.33 |

Table 6: Statistics for the Differential Changes in Math Scores Growth (TRT - CTRL)
Finally, Figure 4 shows the changes in mean percentile ranking between TRT and CTRL.

## Mean Percentile Plot - TRT vs CTRL



Figure 4: Changes in Percentile Ranking for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2018/19 and 2021/22

[^0]
### 3.5 Grade-Level Analysis

### 3.5.1 Grade Level Result Tables

The following tables (Table 7, 8, and 9) present a disaggregation of results by grade level. The far right column in each table also shows the average ST Math Progress for the TRT set.

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Prog. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.18.19 | 115 | 115 | 7855 | -0.26 | 42.60 | - |
| TRT.21.22 | 115 | 115 | 7130 | 0.01 | 49.01 | 52.75 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.27 | 6.41 | - |
| CTRL.18.19 | 115 | 115 | 8510 | -0.25 | 42.98 | - |
| CTRL.21.22 | 115 | 115 | 7916 | -0.14 | 45.80 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | 0.11 | 2.82 | - |

Table 7: Grade 3 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Prog. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.18.19 | 116 | 116 | 8967 | -0.17 | 44.95 | - |
| TRT.21.22 | 116 | 116 | 8050 | 0.11 | 52.77 | 54.87 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.28 | 7.82 | - |
| CTRL.18.19 | 116 | 115 | 7970 | -0.17 | 45.15 | - |
| CTRL.21.22 | 116 | 115 | 7440 | -0.14 | 44.95 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | 0.03 | -0.20 | - |

Table 8: Grade 4 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Prog. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.18.19 | 89 | 89 | 6631 | -0.26 | 41.76 | - |
| TRT.21.22 | 89 | 89 | 6044 | -0.02 | 47.88 | 53.87 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.24 | 6.11 | - |
| CTRL.18.19 | 89 | 89 | 6987 | -0.25 | 42.22 | - |
| CTRL.21.22 | 89 | 89 | 6359 | -0.27 | 40.10 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | -0.02 | -2.12 | - |

Table 9: Grade 5 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets

### 3.5.2 Grade-Level Analysis of Changes in Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced

Figure 5 shows the changes in the grade-mean $z$-scores of students for the TRT and CTRL datasets, disaggregated by grade:

Changes in Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced - 2021/22 vs 2018/19


Figure 5: Changes in Grade-Mean Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced (See Section 3.1) for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2018/19 and 2021/22

Table 10 shows the statistics for the differences between TRT and CTRL (Treatment - Control) for these same z -score changes as shown in Figure 5.

|  | Estimate | P-Value | Int.Low | Int.High |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Grade 3 | 0.16 | 0.08 | -0.02 | 0.35 |
| Grade 4 | 0.25 | $0.01^{*}$ | 0.08 | 0.43 |
| Grade 5 | 0.26 | $0.01^{*}$ | 0.07 | 0.45 |

Table 10: Statistics for the Differential Changes in Z-scores (See Section 3.1) Growth, (TRT - CTRL)

## 4 Effect Size

The following table shows the effect sizes for $z$-score of Proficient or Advanced.

|  | Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced Effect Size |
| :--- | :---: |
| Grade 3 | 0.17 |
| Grade 4 | 0.25 |
| Grade 5 | 0.26 |
| All Grades | 0.23 |

Table 11: Cohen's d Effect Size

## 5 Findings Summary

USA grades 3, 4, and 5 using ST Math for the year 2021/22 averaged $12.2 \%$ ST Math Progress. $324 / 4609$ grades (7\%) averaged covering more than $40 \%$ of ST Math content. Statistically significant differences were found in this analysis for both grade-aggregated and individual grade-level results. Looking at Table 6, a statistically significant difference was found for grade-aggregated z-score, with an estimate of 0.22 points favorable for the ST Math treatment set. Further, referring to table 10, grades 4 and 5 ST Math treatment sets outpeformed their matched controls for z-score of Proficient or Advanced with statistically significant differences of 0.25 and 0.26 , respectively.

## 6 Confounders

Despite best efforts in minimizing confounders to the results of this analysis, there still remain a few input variables that could be significant in affecting differences of state test score outcomes between the Treatment and Control sets. One issue is the lack of randomization of grades chosen to receive the ST Math treatment. Instead of randomized selection, Treatment grades are self-selected. Self-selection can be an indication of districts or schools with a focus on math, an appetite for change, and with a spotlight on math training. Furthermore, not all grades using the ST Math program are chosen for analysis. Each grade must pass two specific filters to be considered for the Treatment set: the first being an enrollment filter of at least $85 \%$ of students in each grade using the program, and the second being a progress filter of at least $40 \%$ of the program completed on average by students in that grade. These filters might indicate relatively high-functioning schools with a team of relatively effective teachers in that grade, thus resulting in better instruction overall. A mitigation of this possible confounder is our selection of treatment groups on the grade level, rather than the teacher level, so there is no cherry picking of teachers: the full range of teachers in each grade is included. Moreover, the specific teachers may often be the same in the baseline year as in the current year, so the Treatment growth is not due to teacher differences. Finally, a possible confounder lies in the "business as usual" conditions at the matched control grades chosen for each analysis. It's unknown whether these control grades used other programs that could affect the comparison of the two sets of grades.

## 7 Lists of Schools

### 7.1 Treatment Schools

The following tables list the treatment schools and grades (after $85 \%$ enrollment and $40 \%$ progress filtering) used in the analysis.

| PID | State | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 39415 | AZ | Glendale Elementary District | Bicentennial North School | 5, 4 |
| 45646 | AZ | J O Combs Unified School District | Kathryn Sue Simonton Elementary | 3 |
| 66717 | CA | Bellflower Unified | Stephen Foster Elementary | 4 |
| 3009938 | CA | Bellflower Unified | Craig Williams Elementary | 3 |
| 4455342 | CA | Bellflower Unified | Albert Baxter Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| 137990 | CA | Hope Elementary | Hope Elementary | 5, 3, 4 |
| 91011 | CA | Le Grand Union Elementary | Le Grand Elementary | 5 |
| 75952 | CA | Los Angeles Unified | Soto Street Elementary | 3 |
| 11829889 | CA | Los Angeles Unified | Sylmar Leadership Academy | 5 |
| 140040 | CA | Oxnard | Curren Elementary | 3, 4 |
| 140052 | CA | Oxnard | Driffill Elementary | 5, 3 |
| 140076 | CA | Oxnard | Harrington Elementary | 5 |
| 140117 | CA | Oxnard | Kamala Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| 140129 | CA | Oxnard | Marina West Elementary | 5 |
| 140131 | CA | Oxnard | McKinna Elementary | 4 |
| 140167 | CA | Oxnard | Sierra Linda Elementary | 3, 5 |
| 1876864 | CA | Oxnard | Lemonwood Elementary | 3 |
| 3054830 | CA | Oxnard | Christa McAuliffe Elementary | 3 |
| 4017110 | CA | Oxnard | Emilie Ritchen Elementary | 5, 3 |
| 4748682 | CA | Oxnard | Norman R. Brekke Elementary | 4, 5, 3 |
| 5273173 | CA | Oxnard | Thurgood Marshall Elementary | 4 |
| 2104119 | CA | Rocklin Unified | Rocklin Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| 4032495 | CA | San Mateo-Foster City | Fiesta Gardens International Elementary | 5 |
| 11829920 | CA | Sierra Foothill Charter | Sierra Foothill Charter | 3, 4, 5 |
| 99271 | CA | Tustin Unified | Robert Heideman Elementary | 4 |
| 143030 | CO | Adams 12 Five Star Schools | Westview Elementary School | 3 |
| 146599 | CO | Denver County 1 | Doull Elementary School | 5 |
| 5099367 | CO | Denver County 1 | Lena Archuleta Elementary School | 3 |
| 162696 | CT | Bristol School District | Edgewood School | 5 |
| 162701 | CT | Bristol School District | Ellen P. Hubbell School | 3 |
| 162725 | CT | Bristol School District | Ivy Drive School | 3, 4, 5 |
| 162799 | CT | Bristol School District | South Side School | 5, 3, 4 |
| 162804 | CT | Bristol School District | Stafford School | 4 |
| 159170 | CT | Brookfield School District | Huckleberry Hill Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| 160648 | CT | Stamford School District | Davenport Ridge School | 5 |
| 243056 | IA | Cedar Rapids Comm School District | Cleveland Elementary School | 3 |
| 243317 | IA | Cedar Rapids Comm School District | Nixon Elementary School | 5, 4 |
| 3323617 | IA | Cedar Rapids Comm School District | Truman Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| 4034687 | IA | Cedar Rapids Comm School District | Jackson Elementary School | 5 |
| 5101207 | IA | Cedar Rapids Comm School District | Viola Gibson Elementary School | 5 |
| 231039 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Fred Becker Elementary School | 4 |
| 231053 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Poyner Elementary | 3 |
| 231077 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Cunningham School | 5, 3 |
| 231120 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Irving Elementary School | 4, 5 |
| 231156 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Lou Henry Elementary School | 4, 3, 5 |
| 231168 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Kittrell Elementary School | 5, 3, 4 |
| 231170 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Lincoln Elementary School | 5, 3, 4 |
| 231194 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Lowell Elementary School | 4, 5, 3 |
| 231209 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Highland Elementary School | 3, 4, 5 |
| 231223 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Orange Elementary School | 3, 4, 5 |
| 10021503 | IA | Waterloo Comm School District | Kingsley Elementary School | 5, 3, 4 |
| 10010413 | IA | Western Dubuque Comm School District | Peosta Elementary School | 5, 3, 4 |
| 420838 | MA | Amesbury | Amesbury Elementary | 4, 3 |
| 420852 | MA | Amesbury | Amesbury Middle | 5 |
| 1398496 | MA | Amesbury | Charles C Cashman Elementary | 4, 3 |

Table 12: Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset)

| PID | State | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 440979 | MA | Boston | Mozart Elementary School | 4, 5, 3 |
| 437984 | MA | Brockton | Brookfield | 4, 3, 5 |
| 438005 | MA | Brockton | Downey | 5 |
| 438079 | MA | Brockton | Hancock | 3, 5 |
| 438122 | MA | Brockton | John F Kennedy | 5, 3, 4 |
| 438237 | MA | Brockton | Manthala George Jr. School | 3, 4, 5 |
| 4838110 | MA | Brockton | Louis F Angelo Elementary | 5, 4 |
| 428880 | MA | Cambridge | Kennedy-Longfellow | 3 |
| 428971 | MA | Cambridge | Graham and Parks | 4, 3 |
| 4037017 | MA | Cambridge | Cambridgeport | 3 |
| 5009245 | MA | Cambridge | Amigos School | 3, 5 |
| 421193 | MA | Danvers | Great Oak | 5, 3, 4 |
| 421222 | MA | Danvers | Ivan G Smith | 3 |
| 421246 | MA | Danvers | Riverside | 3 |
| 421272 | MA | Danvers | Willis E Thorpe | 5, 4 |
| 418316 | MA | Dartmouth | George H Potter | 4, 5 |
| 418330 | MA | Dartmouth | Joseph Demello | 4, 5, 3 |
| 418641 | MA | Fall River | Carlton M. Viveiros Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| 416502 | MA | Falmouth | East Falmouth Elementary | 4, 3 |
| 416540 | MA | Falmouth | Mullen-Hall | 3, 4 |
| 416552 | MA | Falmouth | North Falmouth Elementary | 3, 4 |
| 416564 | MA | Falmouth | Teaticket | 3, 4 |
| 445955 | MA | Leicester | Leicester Elementary | 4, 3 |
| 430895 | MA | Lowell | John J Shaughnessy | 4, 3 |
| 430924 | MA | Lowell | S Christa McAuliffe Elementary | 4 |
| 430936 | MA | Lowell | Washington | 4, 3 |
| 4015368 | MA | Lowell | Dr Gertrude Bailey | 4 |
| 4348971 | MA | Lowell | Joseph McAvinnue | 4, 3 |
| 416071 | MA | Mashpee | Quashnet School | 4,3 |
| 446325 | MA | Mendon-Upton | Memorial School | 3, 4 |
| 4868701 | MA | Mendon-Upton | Henry P Clough | 4, 3 |
| 436019 | MA | Needham | William Mitchell | 4, 5 |
| 419138 | MA | New Bedford | Charles S Ashley | 3,5 |
| 431863 | MA | Newton | C C Burr | 5 |
| 432001 | MA | Newton | Mason-Rice | 5, 4, 3 |
| 446674 | MA | Northbridge | Northbridge Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| 419554 | MA | Norton | L G Nourse Elementary | 3 |
| 4802472 | MA | Norton | Henri A. Yelle | 4, 5 |
| 3381683 | MA | Palmer | Old Mill Pond | 3 |
| 423373 | MA | Peabody | John E. McCarthy | 4 |
| 446818 | MA | Shrewsbury | Calvin Coolidge School | 4 |
| 446868 | MA | Shrewsbury | Spring Street School | 4 |
| 432702 | MA | Stoneham | South | 3, 4 |
| 446284 | MA | Wachusett | Thomas Prince | 5, 4, 3 |
| 433005 | MA | Wakefield | Woodville School | 4 |
| 433017 | MA | Wakefield | Greenwood | 4, 3 |
| 433055 | MA | Wakefield | Walton | 3, 4 |
| 436916 | MA | Walpole | Old Post Road | 3,5 |
| 3333351 | MA | Walpole | Boyden | 4 |
| 439463 | MA | Wareham | Wareham Middle | 5 |
| 433524 | MA | Wayland | Happy Hollow School | 5, 3, 4 |
| 437192 | MA | Weymouth | Academy Avenue | 3, 4 |
| 437348 | MA | Weymouth | Lawrence W Pingree | 4, 3 |
| 437362 | MA | Weymouth | Ralph Talbot | 3 |
| 437398 | MA | Weymouth | Thomas W. Hamilton Primary School | 4 |
| 437415 | MA | Weymouth | Wessagusset | 4, 3 |
| 3250345 | MA | Weymouth | Frederick C Murphy | 4, 3 |
| 4348983 | MA | Weymouth | Thomas V Nash | 4, 3 |
| 447551 | MA | Worcester | Belmont Street Community | 3, 5 |

Table 13: Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset)

| PID | State | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 447599 | MA | Worcester | Burncoat Street | 3, 4, 5 |
| 447628 | MA | Worcester | Canterbury | 4, 3, 5 |
| 447630 | MA | Worcester | Chandler Magnet | 5, 3, 4 |
| 447719 | MA | Worcester | Elm Park Community | 3, 4, 5 |
| 447721 | MA | Worcester | Flagg Street | 4, 3, 5 |
| 447745 | MA | Worcester | Goddard School/Science Technical | 3 |
| 447769 | MA | Worcester | Gates Lane | 4, 3 |
| 447771 | MA | Worcester | Grafton Street | 4, 5 |
| 447824 | MA | Worcester | Heard Street | 4, 5 |
| 447848 | MA | Worcester | Lake View | 5, 3, 4 |
| 447874 | MA | Worcester | Lincoln Street | 5, 4 |
| 447898 | MA | Worcester | May Street | 4, 3, 5 |
| 447915 | MA | Worcester | Midland Street | 5, 3, 4 |
| 447939 | MA | Worcester | Quinsigamond | 3, 4 |
| 447941 | MA | Worcester | Nelson Place | 3, 4, 5 |
| 447965 | MA | Worcester | Norrback Avenue | 4, 5, 3 |
| 448024 | MA | Worcester | Rice Square | 3, 4, 5 |
| 448036 | MA | Worcester | Roosevelt | 3, 4, 5 |
| 448050 | MA | Worcester | Worcester Arts Magnet School | 4, 3, 5 |
| 448062 | MA | Worcester | Tatnuck | 3, 5 |
| 448074 | MA | Worcester | Thorndyke Road | 5, 3, 4 |
| 448098 | MA | Worcester | Vernon Hill School | 3, 5 |
| 448115 | MA | Worcester | West Tatnuck | 3, 4 |
| 448127 | MA | Worcester | Wawecus Road School | 4, 5 |
| 448141 | MA | Worcester | Woodland Academy | 3, 4, 5 |
| 1540766 | MA | Worcester | Francis J McGrath Elementary | 5, 3, 4 |
| 3333466 | MA | Worcester | Jacob Hiatt Magnet | 4, 3, 5 |
| 505476 | MI | Holly Area School District | Davisburg Elementary School | 5 |
| 4750764 | MI | Holly Area School District | Rose Pioneer Elementary School | 3, 4, 5 |
| 544721 | MN | Saint Paul Public Schools | Como Park Elementary | 3, 5, 4 |
| 693889 | NJ | Madison Public School District | Kings Road School | 3 |
| 693920 | NJ | Madison Public School District | Torey J. Sabatini School | 3 |
| 713221 | NV | Carson City | Fremont Elementary | 4 |
| 12238491 | NV | Esmeralda | Doral Academy West Pebble | 4, 3 |
| 5070622 | OH | Granville Exempted Village | Granville Intermediate School | 5 |
| 872059 | OR | Eagle Point SD 9 | Eagle Rock Elementary School | 5, 4 |
| 911447 | PA | CHAMBERSBURG AREA SD | GRANDVIEW EL SCH | 3,5 |
| 5265011 | PA | WEST ALLEGHENY SD | DONALDSON ELEM SCH | 5 |
| 1034822 | TX | BURLESON ISD | FRAZIER EL | 4 |
| 1034860 | TX | BURLESON ISD | WILLIAM STRIBLI | 4, 5 |
| 5091169 | TX | BURLESON ISD | RICHARD BRANSOM | 4 |
| 4916358 | TX | CYPRESS-FAIRBAN | GLEASON EL | 4 |
| 5096743 | TX | CYPRESS-FAIRBAN | SAMPSON EL | 4 |
| 11451494 | TX | CYPRESS-FAIRBAN | SWENKE EL | 4 |
| 11919379 | TX | CYPRESS-FAIRBAN | POPE EL | 5, 3, 4 |
| 10023109 | TX | DALLAS ISD | ARTURO SALAZAR | 4 |
| 1052513 | TX | EVERMAN ISD | SOUDER EL | 3 |
| 11563372 | TX | GALVESTON ISD | BURNET EL | 3 |
| 4853586 | TX | KLEIN ISD | HASSLER EL | 3 |
| 11713931 | TX | KLEIN ISD | BLACKSHEAR EL | 3 |
| 4949123 | TX | MANSFIELD ISD | IMOGENE GIDEON | 4 |
| 1028639 | TX | MARSHALL ISD | CROCKETT EL | 4 |
| 1041485 | TX | MIDLAND ISD | DE ZAVALA EL | 3 |
| 1006978 | TX | NEW BRAUNFELS I | CARL SCHURZ EL | 4 |
| 997685 | TX | NORTH EAST ISD | CASTLE HILLS EL | 3 |
| 1061356 | TX | POTH ISD | POTH EL | 4 |
| 10006931 | TX | SPRING ISD | MILTON COOPER E | 4 |
| 1040986 | TX | TIDEHAVEN ISD | MARKHAM EL | 3 |
| 1068641 | UT | Weber District | West Weber School | 5 |

Table 14: Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset)

### 7.2 Control Schools

The following tables list the control schools and grades (matched control grades to treatment grades) used in the analysis.

| PID | State | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 38916 | AZ | Cartwright Elementary District | John F. Long | 4 |
| 11555193 | AZ | Math and Science Success Academy, Inc. | Math and Science Success Academy | 3 |
| 5012553 | AZ | Pathfinder Charter School Foundation | Imagine Cortez Park Elementary | 5 |
| 118944 | CA | Banta Unified | Banta Elementary | 4 |
| 106989 | CA | Barstow Unified | Lenwood Elementary | 5 |
| 11129691 | CA | Bellevue Union | Taylor Mountain Elementary | 4 |
| 66884 | CA | Burbank Unified | Ralph Emerson Elementary | 5 |
| 110526 | CA | Chula Vista Elementary | Allen (Ella B.) Elementary | 4 |
| 110643 | CA | Chula Vista Elementary | Loma Verde Elementary | 3 |
| 55914 | CA | Del Norte County Unified | Pine Grove Elementary | 5 |
| 137823 | CA | Dinuba Unified | Wilson Elementary | 3 |
| 4456425 | CA | Dos Palos Oro Loma Joint Unified | Bernhard Marks Elementary | 3 |
| 107804 | CA | Fontana Unified | Randall Pepper Elementary | 3 |
| 3253103 | CA | Gustine Unified | Romero Elementary | 5 |
| 69991 | CA | Hacienda la Puente Unified | Bixby Elementary | 5 |
| 2223650 | CA | Hollister | Calaveras Elementary | 5 |
| 4914881 | CA | Imperial Unified | T. L. Waggoner Elementary | 4 |
| 111398 | CA | Julian Union Elementary | Julian Elementary | 4 |
| 2897653 | CA | Jurupa Unified | Indian Hills Elementary | 5 |
| 58150 | CA | Kings Canyon Joint Unified | McCord Elementary | 3 |
| 64939 | CA | Lakeport Unified | Terrace Middle | 4 |
| 111477 | CA | Lakeside Union Elementary | Lindo Park Elementary | 3 |
| 3242520 | CA | Lancaster Elementary | Nancy Cory Elementary | 5 |
| 78916 | CA | Lynwood Unified | Wilson Elementary | 4 |
| 79740 | CA | Norwalk-La Mirada Unified | Foster Road Elementary | 5 |
| 12103133 | CA | PUC Community Charter Elementary | PUC Community Charter Elementary | 4 |
| 4803414 | CA | Palo Alto Unified | Barron Park Elementary | 3 |
| 102244 | CA | Palo Verde Unified | Ruth Brown Elementary | 3 |
| 3473432 | CA | Plumas Unified | C. Roy Carmichael Elementary | 3 |
| 108860 | CA | Rialto Unified | Merle S. Casey Elementary | 4 |
| 10915746 | CA | Rocky Point Charter | Rocky Point Charter | 5 |
| 105179 | CA | San Juan Unified | Cottage Elementary | 4 |
| 124773 | CA | Santa Maria-Bonita | Alvin Elementary | 5 |
| 5048710 | CA | Santa Rita Union Elementary | McKinnon | 3 |
| 131415 | CA | Shasta Union Elementary | Shasta Elementary | 3 |
| 139417 | CA | Sonora Elementary | Sonora Elementary | 4 |
| 136049 | CA | Stanislaus Union Elementary | Josephine Chrysler Elementary | 5 |
| 120337 | CA | Tracy Joint Unified | North Elementary | 5 |
| 5341536 | CA | Victor Elementary | Challenger School of Sports and Fitness | 3 |
| 3004366 | CA | Wilsona Elementary | Vista San Gabriel Elementary | 3 |
| 11708572 | CA | Yav Pem Suab Academy - Preparing for the | Yav Pem Suab Academy - Preparing for the Future Ch | 5 |
| 109864 | CA | Yucaipa-Calimesa Joint Unified | Calimesa Elementary | 3 |
| 145014 | CO | Boulder Valley Re 2 | Columbine Elementary School | 3 |
| 12108767 | CO | Denver County 1 | KIPP Northeast Elementary | 3 |
| 11452357 | CO | Harrison 2 | Atlas Preparatory Middle School | 5 |
| 162610 | CT | Bloomfield School District | Metacomet School | 4 |
| 174429 | CT | Canterbury School District | Dr. Helen Baldwin Middle School | 5 |
| 173839 | CT | Ellington School District | Center School | 3 |
| 163250 | CT | Enfield School District | Eli Whitney School | 3 |
| 174534 | CT | Killingly School District | Killingly Intermediate School | 5 |
| 160208 | CT | Norwalk School District | Naramake Elementary School | 4 |
| 160301 | CT | Norwalk School District | Wolfpit Integrated Arts Elementary School | 5 |
| 167543 | CT | Regional School District 14 | Mitchell Elementary School | 4 |
| 3316341 | CT | Shelton School District | Sunnyside School | 4 |
| 167749 | CT | Torrington School District | Torringford School | 3 |

Table 15: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

ST Math is created by
MIND Research Institute
www.mindresearch.org


| PID | State | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 174211 | CT | Vernon School District | Center Road School | 3 |
| 171350 | CT | Waterbury School District | Rotella Interdistrict Magnet School | 5 |
| 235346 | IA | Boyer Valley Comm School District | Boyer Valley Elementary School | 4 |
| 249892 | IA | Brooklyn-Guernsey-Malcom Comm School District | Brooklyn-Guernsey-Malcom Elementary School | 5 |
| 238312 | IA | CAL Comm School District | CAL Elementary School | 4 |
| 253051 | IA | Cardinal Comm School District | Cardinal Junior High | 5 |
| 4843660 | IA | Carroll Comm School District | Adams Elementary School | 4 |
| 230724 | IA | Cedar Falls Comm School District | Helen A Hansen Elementary School | 3 |
| 230176 | IA | Centerville Comm School District | Lakeview Elementary | 4, 5 |
| 238130 | IA | Charles City Comm School District | Charles City MS | 5 |
| 238166 | IA | Charles City Comm School District | Lincoln Elementary School | 4 |
| 234122 | IA | Clarke Comm School District | Clarke Community Elementary School | 5 |
| 243903 | IA | Columbus Comm School District | Roundy Elementary School | 3 |
| 249440 | IA | Council Bluffs Comm School District | Hoover Elementary School | 3 |
| 248446 | IA | Des Moines Independent Comm School District | Windsor Elementary | 4 |
| 255994 | IA | Eagle Grove Comm School District | Robert Blue School | 5 |
| 245200 | IA | East Marshall Comm School District | East Marshall Middle School | 5 |
| 1808465 | IA | Eddyville-Blakesburg- Fremont CSD | Fremont Elementary | 4 |
| 239720 | IA | Eldora-New Providence Comm School District | Eldora-New Providence Elementary School | 3 |
| 241759 | IA | lowa City Comm School District | Grant Wood Elementary School | 3 |
| 241826 | IA | Iowa City Comm School District | Kirkwood Elementary School | 3 |
| 241838 | IA | Iowa City Comm School District | Lincoln Elementary School | 4 |
| 12106953 | IA | Iowa City Comm School District | Alexander Elementary | 4,5 |
| 235865 | IA | Lamoni Comm School District | Lamoni Elementary School | 3 |
| 252643 | IA | Lenox Comm School District | Lenox Elementary School | 5 |
| 233623 | IA | Mason City Comm School District | Roosevelt Elementary School | 4 |
| 240054 | IA | Missouri Valley Comm School District | Missouri Valley Elementary | 3 |
| 235891 | IA | Mormon Trail Comm School District | Mormon Trail Elementary School | 4 |
| 240250 | IA | Mount Pleasant Comm School District | Van Allen Elementary School | 3 |
| 232394 | IA | North Butler Comm School District | North Butler Elementary | 4 |
| 250841 | IA | North Scott Comm School District | Alan Shepard Elementary School | 5 |
| 238726 | IA | Paton-Churdan Comm School District | Paton-Churdan Elementary | 3 |
| 246747 | IA | Shenandoah Comm School District | Shenandoah Middle School | 5 |
| 254744 | IA | Sioux City Comm School District | Perry Creek Elementary School | 3 |
| 235695 | IA | Waukee Comm School District | Waukee Elementary School | 5 |
| 2129420 | IA | West Central Comm School District | West Central PK - 8 School | 5 |
| 240121 | IA | West Harrison Comm School District | West Harrison Elementary | 3 |
| 4801193 | MA | Abby Kelley Foster Charter Public (District) | Abby Kelley Foster Charter Public School | 3 |
| 428127 | MA | Acton-Boxborough | McCarthy-Towne School | 4, 5 |
| 2044466 | MA | Acton-Boxborough | Blanchard Memorial School | 4, 5 |
| 417946 | MA | Acushnet | Acushnet Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| 424810 | MA | Agawam | James Clark School | 4 |
| 427367 | MA | Amherst | Wildwood Elementary | 3 |
| 428206 | MA | Arlington | Brackett | 4 |
| 428323 | MA | Arlington | Thompson | 3 |
| 2044636 | MA | Ashburnham-Westminster | Briggs Elementary | 4 |
| 2044741 | MA | Ashburnham-Westminster | Westminster Elementary | 5 |
| 434669 | MA | Avon | Ralph D Butler | 3 |
| 416239 | MA | Barnstable | Centerville Elementary | 3 |
| 416241 | MA | Barnstable | West Villages Elementary School | 3 |
| 417013 | MA | Berkshire Hills | Muddy Brook Regional Elementary School | 4 |
| 434786 | MA | Braintree | Archie T Morrison | 3 |
| 434803 | MA | Braintree | Donald Ross | 4 |
| 3397917 | MA | Braintree | Hollis | 3 |
| 425242 | MA | Brookfield | Brookfield Elementary | 5 |
| 2044545 | MA | Carver | Carver Elementary School | 4 |
| 441753 | MA | Chelsea | Frank M Sokolowski Elementary | 3 |
| 2044375 | MA | Chesterfield-Goshen | New Hingham Regional Elementary | 5 |
| 424949 | MA | Chicopee | Bowie | 5 |
| 425022 | MA | Chicopee | Lambert-Lavoie | 4 |
| 425058 | MA | Chicopee | Streiber Memorial School | 4, 5 |
| 3251820 | MA | Chicopee | Fairview Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| 2044143 | MA | Clarksburg | Clarksburg Elementary | 5 |
| 5009350 | MA | Codman Academy Charter Public (District) | Codman Academy Charter Public School | 4 |
| 435209 | MA | Dedham | Avery | 4, 5 |
| 416320 | MA | Dennis-Yarmouth | Ezra H Baker Innovation School | 3 |
| 429406 | MA | Dracut | Greenmont Avenue | 3 |
| 11821215 | MA | Dudley Street Neighborhood Charter School (District) | Dudley Street Neighborhood Charter School | 5 |
| 3045970 | MA | Easthampton | Neil A Pepin | 4 |
| 429470 | MA | Everett | Sumner G. Whittier School | 3,5 |
| 429482 | MA | Everett | Madeline English School | 3, 4, 5 |
| 429559 | MA | Everett | George Keverian School | 4 |
| 5325025 | MA | Everett | Lafayette School | 4, 5 |
| 418550 | MA | Fall River | Letourneau Elementary School | 5 |

Table 16: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

| PID | State | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 418603 | MA | Fall River | Mary Fonseca Elementary School | 3, 4, 5 |
| 418756 | MA | Fall River | James Tansey | 5 |
| 418782 | MA | Fall River | John J Doran | 3, 4, 5 |
| 418952 | MA | Fall River | William S Greene | 3 |
| 416538 | MA | Falmouth | Morse Pond School | 5 |
| 445474 | MA | Fitchburg | Reingold Elementary | 4 |
| 4913904 | MA | Fitchburg | Arthur M Longsjo Middle School | 5 |
| 11435517 | MA | Fitchburg | McKay Elementary School | 3, 4, 5 |
| 429640 | MA | Framingham | Brophy | 5 |
| 429652 | MA | Framingham | Charlotte A Dunning | 3 |
| 429767 | MA | Framingham | Miriam F McCarthy School | 3 |
| 429779 | MA | Framingham | Barbieri Elementary | 3 |
| 429793 | MA | Framingham | Potter Road | 3, 5 |
| 429810 | MA | Framingham | Mary E Stapleton Elementary | 5 |
| 429858 | MA | Framingham | Harmony Grove Elementary | 4 |
| 12101898 | MA | Framingham | King Elementary School | 3 |
| 445541 | MA | Gardner | Gardner Elementary School | 3 |
| 427501 | MA | Gateway | Littleville Elementary School | 5 |
| 424535 | MA | Gill-Montague | Sheffield Elementary School | 5 |
| 2044301 | MA | Gill-Montague | Gill Elementary | 4 |
| 421624 | MA | Gloucester | Veterans Memorial | 3, 5 |
| 424327 | MA | Greenfield | Federal Street School | 3, 4 |
| 427587 | MA | Hadley | Hadley Elementary | 5 |
| 1834505 | MA | Hamilton-Wenham | Cutler School | 3 |
| 4865400 | MA | Hamilton-Wenham | Bessie Buker Elementary | 4 |
| 427642 | MA | Hatfield | Hatfield Elementary | 4 |
| 424640 | MA | Hawlemont | Hawlemont Regional | 3, 4 |
| 11456573 | MA | Hingham | East Elementary School | 3, 5 |
| 4867977 | MA | Holliston | Miller School | 3 |
| 430182 | MA | Hudson | Mulready Elementary | 4 |
| 1398501 | MA | Hudson | Forest Avenue Elementary | 3 |
| 438768 | MA | Hull | Lillian M Jacobs | 3 |
| 11453686 | MA | Lawrence | Frost Middle School | 5 |
| 4367197 | MA | Lawrence Family Development Charter (District) | Lawrence Family Development Charter School | 4 |
| 4465153 | MA | Learning First Charter Public School (District) | Learning First Charter Public School | 4 |
| 417233 | MA | Lenox | Morris | 4 |
| 445993 | MA | Leominster | Fall Brook | 3, 4 |
| 446076 | MA | Leominster | Johnny Appleseed | 3 |
| 430352 | MA | Lexington | Harrington | 4 |
| 430388 | MA | Lexington | Joseph Estabrook | 4 |
| 430704 | MA | Lowell | Greenhalge | 3, 4 |
| 422654 | MA | Lynnfield | Huckleberry Hill | 4 |
| 430962 | MA | Malden | Ferryway | 4 |
| 431021 | MA | Malden | Salemwood | 3, 5 |
| 431186 | MA | Marlborough | Richer | 4 |
| 438823 | MA | Marshfield | Gov Edward Winslow | 3 |
| 438861 | MA | Marshfield | South River | 5 |
| 4458825 | MA | Martha's Vineyard Charter Public School (District) | Martha's Vineyard Charter Public School | 3 |
| 10752996 | MA | Martin Luther King, Jr. Charter School of Excellence (District) | Martin Luther King, Jr. Charter School of Excellence | 3 |
| 431215 | MA | Maynard | Fowler School | 4 |
| 431459 | MA | Medford | John J McGlynn Elementary School | 5 |
| 3336224 | MA | Methuen | Comprehensive Grammar School | 3 |
| 416461 | MA | Monomoy Regional School District | Chatham Elementary School | 4 |
| 417776 | MA | Mount Greylock | Williamstown Elementary | 3 |
| 2044090 | MA | Mount Greylock | Lanesborough Elementary | 3, 4 |
| 423048 | MA | Nahant | Johnson | 4 |
| 419102 | MA | New Bedford | Abraham Lincoln | 4 |
| 419126 | MA | New Bedford | Betsey B Winslow | 3 |
| 419176 | MA | New Bedford | Ellen R Hathaway | 5 |
| 419188 | MA | New Bedford | Elwyn G Campbell | 4 |
| 1413515 | MA | New Bedford | Casimir Pulaski | 3, 4 |
| 1413527 | MA | New Bedford | Hayden/McFadden | 3, 5 |
| 1540704 | MA | New Bedford | Alfred J Gomes | 3, 4, 5 |
| 12037625 | MA | New Bedford | Renaissance Community Innovation School | 4, 5 |
| 419449 | MA | North Attleborough | Amvet Boulevard | 3 |
| 419451 | MA | North Attleborough | Falls | 3 |
| 432142 | MA | North Middlesex | Ashby Elementary | 4 |
| 1828099 | MA | North Middlesex | Varnum Brook | 4 |
| 1171200 | MA | Northampton | Leeds | 3, 5 |
| 2044674 | MA | Northborough | Fannie E Proctor | 5 |
| 2044026 | MA | Orleans | Orleans Elementary | 4 |
| 427355 | MA | Pelham | Pelham Elementary | 5 |
| 1168344 | MA | Pittsfield | Egremont | 4 |
| 1168497 | MA | Pittsfield | Stearns | 3, 5 |
| 2044698 | MA | Quaboag Regional | Warren Elementary | 4 |

Table 17: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

| PID | State | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 436227 | MA | Quincy | Atherton Hough | 3 |
| 436289 | MA | Quincy | Clifford H Marshall Elementary | 3 |
| 436461 | MA | Quincy | Squantum | 4 |
| 436538 | MA | Randolph | Elizabeth G Lyons Elementary | 4 |
| 436540 | MA | Randolph | J F Kennedy Elementary | 3 |
| 436552 | MA | Randolph | Margaret L Donovan | 3 |
| 10001773 | MA | Reading | Wood End Elementary School | 3 |
| 4887771 | MA | River Valley Charter (District) | River Valley Charter School | 4 |
| 424573 | MA | Rowe | Rowe Elementary | 4 |
| 419736 | MA | Somerset | Chace Street | 3 |
| 419748 | MA | Somerset | North Elementary | 4 |
| 419774 | MA | Somerset | South | 4 |
| 432427 | MA | Somerville | Arthur D Healey | 5 |
| 432477 | MA | Somerville | E Somerville Community | 5 |
| 1415525 | MA | Somerville | Winter Hill Community | 3 |
| 446894 | MA | Southbridge | Charlton Street | 4 |
| 446959 | MA | Southbridge | West Street | 3 |
| 424834 | MA | Southwick-Tolland-Granville Regional School District | Powder Mill School | 3 |
| 446973 | MA | Spencer-E Brookfield | Wire Village School | 3 |
| 4367202 | MA | Springfield International Charter (District) | Springfield International Charter School | 4 |
| 436758 | MA | Stoughton | Helen Hansen Elementary | 3 |
| 432805 | MA | Sudbury | Peter Noyes | 3, 5 |
| 423907 | MA | Swampscott | Clarke | 4 |
| 423919 | MA | Swampscott | Hadley | 4 |
| 420797 | MA | Up-Island Regional | West Tisbury Elementary | 4 |
| 425280 | MA | Wales | Wales Elementary | 4 |
| 433201 | MA | Waltham | James Fitzgerald Elementary School | 3 |
| 433263 | MA | Waltham | Northeast Elementary School | 3 |
| 433421 | MA | Watertown | Hosmer | 4 |
| 433433 | MA | Watertown | James Russell Lowell | 3 |
| 5100150 | MA | Wellesley | Sprague Elementary School | 4 |
| 426507 | MA | West Springfield | Memorial | 3, 4 |
| 433586 | MA | Westford | Day Elementary | 3 |
| 433897 | MA | Winchester | Lynch Elementary | 5 |
| 5342475 | MA | Winthrop | Arthur T. Cummings Elementary School | 4 |
| 434009 | MA | Woburn | Mary D Altavesta | 4 |
| 434059 | MA | Woburn | Goodyear Elementary School | 5 |
| 489652 | MI | Columbia School District | Columbia Upper Elementary School | 4 |
| 509551 | MI | Grand Haven Area Public Schools | White Pines Intermediate School | 5 |
| 490780 | MI | Kalamazoo Public Schools | Indian Prairie Elementary School | 3 |
| 475807 | MI | Wayland Union Schools | Pine Street Elementary | 5 |
| 3248835 | MN | Burnsville-Eagan-Savage School District | Hidden Valley Elementary | 5 |
| 527759 | MN | Columbia Heights Public School District | North Park School for Innovation | 3 |
| 544434 | MN | North St. Paul-Maplewood Oakdale Public School District | Webster Elementary | 4 |
| 690930 | NJ | Colts Neck Township School District | Conover Road Elementary School | 3 |
| 1523342 | NJ | Medford Township School District | Taunton Forge Elementary School | 3 |
| 12309636 | NV | Clark | Kenneth Divich Elementary | 4 |
| 12260169 | NV | Esmeralda | Pinecrest Academy of Nevada Cadence | 3 |
| 2126832 | NV | Washoe | KATHERINE DUNN ELEMENTARY | 4 |
| 825575 | OH | Oakwood City | Smith Elementary School | 5 |
| 11135119 | OR | Bend-LaPine Administrative SD 1 | Ponderosa Elementary | 4 |
| 10774061 | OR | Sweet Home SD 55 | Sweet Home Charter School | 5 |
| 2111617 | PA | JEFFERSON-MORGAN SD | JEFFERSON-MORGAN EL SCH | 5 |
| 912051 | PA | SOUTHERN FULTON SD | SOUTHERN FULTON EL SCH | 3 |
| 925840 | PA | WISSAHICKON SD | STONY CREEK EL SCH | 5 |
| 1018878 | TX | CLEAR CREEK ISD | G H WHITCOMB EL | 4 |
| 1057903 | TX | COMSTOCK ISD | COMSTOCK SCHOOL | 4 |
| 4454178 | TX | COPPELL ISD | VALLEY RANCH EL | 3 |
| 3009744 | TX | DENTON ISD | MCNAIR EL | 3 |
| 1052757 | TX | FORT WORTH ISD | DAVID K SELLARS | 4 |
| 1053191 | TX | FORT WORTH ISD | NATHA HOWELL EL | 3 |
| 1053464 | TX | FORT WORTH ISD | TANGLEWOOD EL | 5 |
| 11445768 | TX | HARPER ISD | HARPER MIDDLE | 5 |
| 5341421 | TX | HIDALGO ISD | HIDALGO PARK EL | 4 |
| 1017484 | TX | HONEY GROVE ISD | HONEY GROVE EL | 3 |
| 4033621 | TX | LAMAR CISD | SUSANNA DICKINS | 4 |
| 1006265 | TX | MCKINNEY ISD | GLEN OAKS EL | 4 |
| 1006277 | TX | MCKINNEY ISD | WEBB EL | 4 |
| 1011454 | TX | MESQUITE ISD | SHANDS EL | 3 |
| 1041540 | TX | MIDLAND ISD | JAMES BOWIE FIN | 4 |
| 12104369 | TX | MIDLAND ISD | BARBARA FASKEN | 3 |
| 10008343 | TX | PLANO ISD | MARTHA HUNT EL | 4 |
| 11555076 | TX | PLEASANT GROVE | PLEASANT GROVE | 4 |
| 1033969 | TX | PORT NECHES-GRO | GROVES EL | 4 |
| 1039121 | TX | ROOSEVELT ISD | ROOSEVELT EL | 3 |

Table 18: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

| PID | State | District | School Name | GRADE |
| ---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1055785 | TX | SAN ANGELO ISD | SANTA RITA EL | 4 |
| 1004657 | TX | WHITE DEER ISD | WHITE DEER EL | 4 |
| 11434795 | TX | WYLIE ISD | DON WHITT EL | 3 |
| 1068380 | UT | Weber District | Bates School | 5 |

Table 19: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)


[^0]:    ${ }^{1 *}$ statistically significant $\mathrm{p}<0.05$

