# USA Math Outcomes Analysis 2017/18 

Grade Levels: 3, 4, 5<br>ST Math Program: Gen-4<br>Analysis Type: Z-score of math proficiency<br>Treatment-Years: 2016/17, 2017/18<br>Baseline-Year: 2015/16<br>Subgroup: All

## Jessica Guise

(C) 2024-07-24


#### Abstract

This analysis evaluates grades using ST Math in the USA in 2017/18. It identifies those grades with nominal or better implementation of the ST Math program, and matches them to randomly selected, similar math-performance comparison grades. The nominal ST Math users are an aggregation of 235 grades, consisting of grades 3,4 , and 5 at 137 schools, with an average baseline z-score of 0.17 . Refer to Figures 2 and 3 for the math performance and demographic distributions. They were matched to 235 similar, randomly selected control grades at 228 schools that never used ST Math. Grade-wise growth in math proficiency was evaluated (i.e. growth in same grade, same school, from 2015/16 to 2017/18) on the mean $z$-scores of percent Proficient or Advanced (see Section 3.1). Grades 3, 4, and 5 aggregated showed an ST Math effect of 0.22 z-score points.


## Contents

1 Introduction ..... 5
1.1 Background ..... 5
1.2 Program Description ..... 5
2 Data Collection ..... 6
2.1 Treatment Grades Pool and Selection ..... 6
2.1.1 Enrollment Filter ..... 6
2.1.2 Content Coverage Filter ..... 6
2.2 Control Grades Pool and Selection ..... 6
3 Data Analysis ..... 8
3.1 Z-scores ..... 8
3.2 Percentile Ranking ..... 8
3.3 Final Treatment and Control ..... 9
3.3.1 ST Math Grade-Aggregated Implementation ( $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment Grades Only) ..... 9
3.3.2 Filtering Treatment and Controls ..... 10
3.3.3 Match of Controls to Treatment ..... 11
3.4 Grade-Aggregated Analysis ..... 13
3.5 Grade-Level Analysis ..... 15
3.5.1 Grade Level Result Tables ..... 15
3.5.2 Grade-Level Analysis of Changes in Z-scores of Proficient or Advanced ..... 16
4 Effect Size ..... 17
5 Findings Summary ..... 17
6 Confounders ..... 17
7 Reference Tables Grouped By School Year ..... 18
8 Lists of Schools ..... 19
8.1 Treatment Schools ..... 19
8.2 Control Schools ..... 22

## List of Figures

1 Histogram of ST Math Percent Progress for $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment Grades 2017/18 ..... 9
2 Baseline Year Density Plots Showing Math Scores and Percent Student Need Match between TRT and CTRL - 2015/16 ..... 11
3 Changes in z-scores (See Section 3.1) for Grade-Aggregated TRT and CTRL datasets between 2015/16 and 2017/18 ..... 13
4 Changes in Percentile Ranking for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2015/16 and 2017/18 ..... 14
5 Changes in Grade-Mean Z-score (See Section 3.1) for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2015/16 and 2017/18 ..... 16

## List of Tables

1 Descriptive Statistics of ST Math Percent Progress for $>=85$ percent Enrollment Grades ..... 9
2 Number of ST Math Grades with $>=85$ percent Enrollment and with $>=40$ percent progress ..... 9
3 Treatment Pool Filtering and Controls: Counts of Grades, Schools, and Students ..... 10
4 Matching TRT and CTRL ..... 12
5 All Grades Together Growth ..... 13
6 Statistics for the Differential Changes in Math Scores Growth (TRT - CTRL) ..... 14
7 Grade 3 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets ..... 15
8 Grade 4 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets ..... 15
9 Grade 5 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets ..... 15
10 Statistics for the Differential Changes in Z-scores (See Section 3.1) Growth, (TRT - CTRL) ..... 16
11 Cohen's d Effect Size ..... 17
12 TRT Grades Detail Sorted by Year ..... 18
13 CTRL Grades Detail Sorted by Year ..... 18
14 Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset) ..... 19
15 Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset) ..... 20
16 Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset) ..... 21
17 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 22
18 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 23
19 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 24
20 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 25

## 1 Introduction

### 1.1 Background

This is a quasi-experimental analysis at the grade-mean level. Entire grades represent the units of analysis, and outcome measures are the 2 -year changes in grade-mean z-score of Proficient or Advanced. The treatment grades used the ST Math program for 2 years, beginning in the 2016/17 school year. The study hypothesis is treatment grades using ST Math will outperform similar matched control grades, using their "business as usual" conditions of instructional content and professional development. The control grades were selected to have similar demographic and math attributes (See Figures 2 and 3) to the treatment grades during the baseline year (2015/16), and did not use ST Math in 2016/17 or 2017/18. The treatment grades' selection pool was all schools using ST Math in grades 3, 4, and 5 in the USA. The control grades' pool was all schools not using ST Math in grades 3, 4, and 5 in the USA. This study method measures effectiveness of the ST Math program when nominally implemented.

### 1.2 Program Description

Spatial-Temporal Math (ST Math) is game-based, instructional software for K-12 students, created by the MIND Research Institute (MIND). The purpose of the program is to boost math comprehension through visual learning. The ST Math software games begin without language or symbol abstractions by posing math problems as purely visual puzzles. In this way, three objectives are accomplished: i) language proficiency prerequisites to engage with the program are minimal, ii) non-mathematical distractions (e.g. back-stories for word problems) are minimized or eliminated - thereby reducing load on working memory, and iii) the actual math in the problem can be represented clearly, simply, and unambiguously. Interactive, animated visual manipulatives provide informative feedback on student solutions. A score of 100 percent on a game level comprised of 4-12 puzzles is required for progression through the levels. Failure requires a re-play of the level, via a new quasi-random set of puzzles. In this way, progression is self-paced.

Besides the self-paced progress made by students in their one-to-one environment, the program is designed to be referenced by teachers during their regular math instruction. It is supplemental to core or basal math instruction and instructional materials. As the great majority of grade-level math standards are covered in the ST Math digital curriculum, completion of $100 \%$ of the entire ST Math curriculum (i.e. completing every Game) is required to cover all grade-level math standards. Teachers receive initial training, either face to face or through self-guided online instruction. The training covers account startup, as well as math learning and growth mindset goals, the pedagogical approach to learning in a visual experiential game, monitoring and intervention of the student 1:1 game play, and connecting of ST Math content to classroom content and pacing.

For students to achieve nominal progress through the program, there is a recommended time-on-task requirement of 90 minutes per week over about 30 weeks. Consistent application of 90 minutes per week throughout the school year is normally sufficient to result in a grade's average ST Math content coverage exceeding $50 \%$ by year-end. In this study, we include grades that have achieved $40 \%$ or more content coverage (Progress) by April 15th.

This is a passive study with no experimental setup or extraordinary communications to any schools. All schools in this study therefore received normal program implementation support through the year from MIND support managers. This support includes bundled startup services of approximately 2-4 hours of training either in-person or online, access to live webinars, regular online and push reports on usage and progress, email/phone helpdesk, and proactive monitoring for gaps or issues by MIND support representatives.

MIND Research Institute initiated, funded, and exercised editorial control over this study.

## 2 Data Collection

Since this analysis uses grades as the unit of analysis, and states publish grade-mean state standardized test scores, the data for student math outcomes is collected from each state education agency's research files (retrieved from state websites). The treatment students use ST Math student accounts served by MIND. Student ST Math usage data is aggregated to grade-level means by MIND.

### 2.1 Treatment Grades Pool and Selection

The Treatment grades pool originated with all schools and grades using ST Math in the USA. From these schools, every grade that had used the ST Math program only for the year 2017/18 was identified. They comprise the Treatment grades pool for this evaluation of 2-year usage.

### 2.1.1 Enrollment Filter

Because the analysis uses grade-mean data, such as grade-mean scale scores or grade-mean proficiency level percentages, it is necessary that the program also be a grade-wide treatment, with the great majority of students in each grade receiving treatment. Otherwise, the grade-means reported by the state of $100 \%$ of tested students would not be valid measures of a smaller fraction of treatment students. MIND's site implementation requirement is that an entire grade, including all teachers and all classes within that grade, use the ST Math program. We validate how closely this is the case for each individual treatment grade by comparing the number of ST Math student accounts at a grade level to the reported enrollment at that grade level. We discard from the Treatment pool any grade with a ratio of ST Math student accounts to reported grade enrollment lower than $85 \%$.

### 2.1.2 Content Coverage Filter

Furthermore, the outcomes measure is a summative year-end test, i.e. the standardized math assessment of that state. The math assessment thus covers all the math standards for that entire grade level. Meanwhile, the ST Math program curriculum (arranged into Learning Objectives) is also aligned to each state's math standards. To infer that the ST Math content is having a valid effect on student outcomes on the summative assessment, we discard any grade with grade-mean of ST Math Progress for its students lower than $40 \%$ by April.

Progress is a percentage, and is defined as Levels completed by the student, divided by the total number of Levels in the grade-level curriculum. Note that student achievement of at least $40 \%$ progress in ST Math is accomplished primarily by teacher assignment of computer session time to students. With sufficient time on task, students make progress. The program helps them self-pace through providing real-time informative feedback for each puzzle.

### 2.2 Control Grades Pool and Selection

The control grades are randomly selected from a control pool of schools in the USA. Though they are randomly selected, they are also matched to be similar to the Treatment grades' math attributes and demographics during the baseline 2015/16 year. The matched attributes include:

- z-score of percent Proficient or Advanced
- percentage of students receiving free or reduced lunch (using the demographic data from MDR).

To mitigate the risk of randomly picking a set of Control grades that generates an outlier for effect, a Monte Carlo approach is used to perform many random picks. The control pool's size is large enough that there are many possible "picks" of closely matched control grades.

One hundred randomly matched picks are made and sets of matched control grades are generated. For each set, the quality of the match as well as the math growth of the potential control set is evaluated. Some picked sets have high average math growth, some have low average math growth. From the set of all picks, a median pick is chosen. This avoids either an unlikely overestimate, or underestimate, of the Control grades' growth. When multiple median picks exist, the control set with the minimal math score differences in the baseline year is chosen.

## 3 Data Analysis

The set of all schools and grades using ST Math in the USA is evaluated for Enrollment percentage and Progress percentage parameters. A filtered Treatment set (TRT) of all ST Math grades with $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment and $\geq 40 \%$ Progress is identified. State math assessment data is tabulated. A matching set of Control grades based on baseline year state math assessment is selected.

Changes in math performance, i.e. the difference in math performance of a grade from a baseline year to the final year, are evaluated and tabulated. Statistical tests of the significance of the difference in math performance changes between Treatment grades and Control grades are performed. Finally, a grade-by-grade disaggregation is performed.

### 3.1 Z-scores

In order to analyze across all states with different math assessments, a new z-score of that test's math proficiency is calculated. For each year being analyzed, by grade, a z-score takes the difference of the grade mean percent proficient and the mean of all percent proficient statewide for that year, and then divides it by the standard deviation of all percent proficient statewide for that year. Here is a fictional example to illustrate the calculation of a z-score for the 2015/16 exam:

## School A, Grade 3, Percent Proficient: 70

Average across all schools statewide, Grade 3: 50
Standard deviation across all schools statewide, Grade 3: 20
Z-score $=(($ School A, Grade 3, Percent Proficient)-(Average across all schools, Grade 3))/(Standard deviation across all schools, Grade 3)

$$
\text { Z-score }=\frac{70-50}{20}=1
$$

The $z$-score is calculated for every grade across all years being analyzed, using the full state data set of schools for the averages and standard deviations. The use of z-scores is a valid statistical method to normalize any dataset and to enable analysis across otherwise uncomparable exams. In this report, we only analyze z-scores.

### 3.2 Percentile Ranking

These newly calculated z-scores can then be converted into a percentile ranking. Each percentile ranking shows the grade's performance relative to the others in that year and grade. For example, for a specific grade 3, a percentile ranking of 50 shows that this grade 3 performed at the average of all third grades in the state for that testing year.

### 3.3 Final Treatment and Control

### 3.3.1 ST Math Grade-Aggregated Implementation ( $\geq \mathbf{8 5 \%}$ Enrollment Grades Only)

ST Math Percent Grade Mean Progress Distribution - 2017/18


Figure 1: Histogram of ST Math Percent Progress for $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment Grades 2017/18
For all ST Math grades with Enrollment $\geq 85 \%$, Figure 1 shows the frequency distribution of gradeaverage Progress percentage through the program. Note that we will only be using grades with $\geq 40 \%$ Progress as the Treatment Group.

Table 1 provides descriptive statistics of the Progress distribution. Table 2 shows the number of remaining treatment grades after applying enrollment and progress filters.

|  | Min. | Max. | Average | S.D. |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| ST Math \% Progress | 0.0 | 96.3 | 27.5 | 17.2 |

Table 1: Descriptive Statistics of ST Math Percent Progress for $>=85$ percent Enrollment Grades

| Grades with $>=85 \%$ Enrollment: | 977 |
| ---: | :--- |
| Grades with in addition $>=40 \%$ Progress: | 235 |

Table 2: Number of ST Math Grades with $>=85$ percent Enrollment and with $>=40$ percent progress

### 3.3.2 Filtering Treatment and Controls

Table 3 shows the total number of grades in the Treatment pool, the number of grades that exceeded the $85 \%$ Enrollment figure, and also the $40 \%$ Progress filter. Other rows in the table indicate counts of numbers of students (2017/18 from state testing count) and counts of number of schools represented. The number of matched Control (CTRL) grades, students, and schools is also shown.

|  | Grade 3 | Grade 4 | Grade 5 | Total |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ST Math Using Grades | 447 | 440 | 419 | 1306 |
| ST Math Using Schools | 447 | 440 | 419 | 543 |
| ST Math Students | 34243 | 34925 | 33765 | 102933 |
| ST Math Grades (Enroll $>=85 \%$ ) | 345 | 330 | 302 | 977 |
| TRT Grades (Enroll $>=85 \%$ \& Prog $>=40 \%)$ | 85 | 78 | 72 | 235 |
| TRT Schools (Enroll $>=85 \%$ \& Prog $>=40 \%)$ | 83 | 78 | 72 | 137 |
| TRT Students (Enroll $>=85 \%$ \& Prog $>=40 \%)$ | 7314 | 6756 | 5817 | 19887 |
| CTRL Grades | 85 | 78 | 72 | 235 |
| CTRL Schools | 85 | 78 | 72 | 228 |
| CTRL Students | 6670 | 6136 | 5430 | 18236 |

Table 3: Treatment Pool Filtering and Controls: Counts of Grades, Schools, and Students

### 3.3.3 Match of Controls to Treatment

Figure 2 shows the density plots of the baseline $z$-score of percent students at state assessment Proficient or Advanced (left plot) and the percentage of students needing free or reduced lunch (right plot) for treatment grades overlayed on control grades, showing the closeness of the match obtained between Treatment and Control sets of grades in the baseline year, 2015/16.


Figure 2: Baseline Year Density Plots Showing Math Scores and Percent Student Need Match between TRT and CTRL - 2015/16

Table 4 shows the difference of the means of Treatment versus Control in the baseline year, with accompanying p-values, for mean z-score of percent Proficient or Advanced and for percent of students receiving free or reduced lunch. The large $p$-values show the differences between the Treatment and Control grades are not statistically significant.

|  | Mean(TRT) | SD(TRT) | Mean(CTRL) | SD(CTRL) | Estimate | P-Value | Effect Size |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced $-2015 / 16$ | 0.17 | 0.96 | 0.13 | 0.91 | 0.04 | 0.64 | 0.04 |
| Percent Free or Reduced Lunch | 49.26 | 24.56 | 49.25 | 24.78 | 0.02 | 0.99 | 0.00 |

Table 4: Matching TRT and CTRL

### 3.4 Grade-Aggregated Analysis

Table 5 shows for both Treatment (TRT) and Control (CTRL) aggregation across grades of z-score distributions. The far right column also shows the average ST Math Progress for the TRT set.

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Comp. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.15.16 | 235 | 137 | 18298 | 0.17 | 55.22 | - |
| TRT.17.18 | 235 | 137 | 18114.8 | 0.32 | 60.20 | 52.73 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.15 | 4.97 | - |
| CTRL.15.16 | 235 | 228 | 19040 | 0.13 | 54.38 | - |
| CTRL.17.18 | 235 | 228 | 18236.4 | 0.06 | 52.75 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | -0.06 | -1.63 | - |

Table 5: All Grades Together Growth
Figure 3 shows the changes in mean z-scores of percent Proficient or Advanced for the gradeaggregated Treatment and Control sets.

Changes in Z-scores - 2017/18 vs 2015/16


Figure 3: Changes in z-scores (See Section 3.1) for Grade-Aggregated TRT and CTRL datasets between 2015/16 and 2017/18

Further, Table 6 shows the statistics for the differences in changes between TRT and CTRL (Treatment - Control) for these same z -score changes as in the above figure. ${ }^{1}$

|  | Estimate | P-Value | Int.Low | Int. High |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Z-Score | 0.22 | $0.00^{*}$ | 0.11 | 0.33 |

Table 6: Statistics for the Differential Changes in Math Scores Growth (TRT - CTRL)
Finally, Figure 4 shows the changes in mean percentile ranking between TRT and CTRL.

## Mean Percentile Plot - TRT vs CTRL



Figure 4: Changes in Percentile Ranking for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2015/16 and 2017/18

[^0]
### 3.5 Grade-Level Analysis

### 3.5.1 Grade Level Result Tables

The following tables (Table 7, 8, and 9) present a disaggregation of results by grade level. The far right column in each table also shows the average ST Math Progress for the TRT set.

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Prog. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.15.16 | 85 | 83 | 6883 | 0.14 | 54.96 | - |
| TRT.17.18 | 85 | 83 | 6576 | 0.30 | 59.89 | 52.79 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.16 | 4.93 | - |
| CTRL.15.16 | 85 | 85 | 6872 | 0.16 | 55.21 | - |
| CTRL.17.18 | 85 | 85 | 6670 | 0.06 | 53.00 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | -0.10 | -2.21 | - |

Table 7: Grade 3 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Prog. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.15.16 | 78 | 78 | 6177 | 0.34 | 60.63 | - |
| TRT.17.18 | 78 | 78 | 6179.55 | 0.44 | 64.01 | 53.19 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.11 | 3.38 | - |
| CTRL.15.16 | 78 | 78 | 6260 | 0.25 | 58.45 | - |
| CTRL.17.18 | 78 | 78 | 6136 | 0.16 | 56.29 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | -0.09 | -2.15 | - |

Table 8: Grade 4 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Prog. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.15.16 | 72 | 72 | 5238 | 0.01 | 49.67 | - |
| TRT.17.18 | 72 | 72 | 5359.25 | 0.21 | 56.42 | 52.18 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.20 | 6.75 | - |
| CTRL.15.16 | 72 | 72 | 5908 | -0.04 | 49.00 | - |
| CTRL.17.18 | 72 | 72 | 5430.4 | -0.04 | 48.62 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | -0.00 | -0.38 | - |

Table 9: Grade 5 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets

### 3.5.2 Grade-Level Analysis of Changes in Z-scores of Proficient or Advanced

Figure 5 shows the changes in the grade-mean z-scores of students for the TRT and CTRL datasets, disaggregated by grade:

## Changes in Z-score - 2017/18 vs 2015/16



Figure 5: Changes in Grade-Mean Z-score (See Section 3.1) for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2015/16 and 2017/18

Table 10 shows the statistics for the differences between TRT and CTRL (Treatment - Control) for these same $z$-score changes as shown in Figure 5.

|  | Estimate | P-Value | Int.Low | Int.High |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Grade 3 | 0.26 | $0.01^{*}$ | 0.05 | 0.46 |
| Grade 4 | 0.19 | $0.03^{*}$ | 0.02 | 0.37 |
| Grade 5 | 0.20 | 0.06 | -0.01 | 0.41 |

Table 10: Statistics for the Differential Changes in Z-scores (See Section 3.1) Growth, (TRT - CTRL)

## 4 Effect Size

The following table shows the effect sizes for z-score of Proficient or Advanced.

|  | Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced Effect Size |
| :--- | :---: |
| Grade 3 | 0.30 |
| Grade 4 | 0.20 |
| Grade 5 | 0.22 |
| All Grades | 0.24 |

Table 11: Cohen's d Effect Size

## 5 Findings Summary

USA grades 3, 4, and 5 using ST Math for the year 2017/18 averaged 25.2\% ST Math Progress. $279 / 1306$ grades ( $21 \%$ ) averaged covering more than $40 \%$ of ST Math content. Statistically significant differences were found in this analysis for both grade-aggregated and individual grade levels. Looking at Table 6, a statistically significant difference was found for grade-aggregated z-score, with an estimate of 0.22 points favorable for the ST Math treatment set. Looking at Table 10, grades 3 and 4 ST math treatment sets outperformed their matched controls for state assessment z-scores with statistically significant differences of 0.26 and 0.19 , respectively.

## 6 Confounders

Despite best efforts in minimizing confounders to the results of this analysis, there still remain a few input variables that could be significant in affecting differences of state test score outcomes between the Treatment and Control sets. One issue is the lack of randomization of grades chosen to receive the ST Math treatment. Instead of randomized selection, Treatment grades are self-selected. Self-selection can be an indication of districts or schools with a focus on math, an appetite for change, and with a spotlight on math training. Furthermore, not all grades using the ST Math program are chosen for analysis. Each grade must pass two specific filters to be considered for the Treatment set: the first being an enrollment filter of at least $85 \%$ of students in each grade using the program, and the second being a progress filter of at least $40 \%$ of the program completed on average by students in that grade. These filters might indicate relatively high-functioning schools with a team of relatively effective teachers in that grade, thus resulting in better instruction overall. A mitigation of this possible confounder is our selection of treatment groups on the grade level, rather than the teacher level, so there is no cherry picking of teachers: the full range of teachers in each grade is included. Moreover, the specific teachers may often be the same in the baseline year as in the current year, so the Treatment growth is not due to teacher differences. Finally, a possible confounder lies in the "business as usual" conditions at the matched control grades chosen for each analysis. It's unknown whether these control grades used other programs that could affect the comparison of the two sets of grades. The Monte Carlo Method is used to mitigate the possibility of control picks being favorable or unfavorable (see Section 2.3).

## 7 Reference Tables Grouped By School Year

The following tables show grade-level details, grouped by school year and for treatment (Table 12) and controls (Table 13) separately.

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Comp. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Grade 3 (15.16) | 85 | 83 | 6883 | 0.14 | 54.96 | - |
| Grade 4 (15.16) | 78 | 78 | 6177 | 0.34 | 60.63 | - |
| Grade 5 (15.16) | 72 | 72 | 5238 | 0.01 | 49.67 | - |
| All Grades (15.16) | 235 | 137 | 18298 | 0.17 | 55.22 | - |
| Grade 3 (17.18) | 85 | 83 | 6576 | 0.30 | 59.89 | 52.79 |
| Grade 4 (17.18) | 78 | 78 | 6179.55 | 0.44 | 64.01 | 53.19 |
| Grade 5 (17.18) | 72 | 72 | 5359.25 | 0.21 | 56.42 | 52.18 |
| All Grades (17.18) | 235 | 137 | 18114.8 | 0.32 | 60.20 | 52.73 |

Table 12: TRT Grades Detail Sorted by Year

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Comp. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Grade 3 (15.16) | 85 | 85 | 6872 | 0.16 | 55.21 | - |
| Grade 4 (15.16) | 78 | 78 | 6260 | 0.25 | 58.45 | - |
| Grade 5 (15.16) | 72 | 72 | 5908 | -0.04 | 49.00 | - |
| All Grades (15.16) | 235 | 228 | 19040 | 0.13 | 54.38 | - |
| Grade 3 (17.18) | 85 | 85 | 6670 | 0.06 | 53.00 | - |
| Grade 4 (17.18) | 78 | 78 | 6136 | 0.16 | 56.29 | - |
| Grade 5 (17.18) | 72 | 72 | 5430.4 | -0.04 | 48.62 | - |
| All Grades (17.18) | 235 | 228 | 18236.4 | 0.06 | 52.75 | - |

Table 13: CTRL Grades Detail Sorted by Year

## 8 Lists of Schools

### 8.1 Treatment Schools

The following tables list the treatment schools and grades (after 85\% enrollment and 40\% progress filtering) used in the analysis.

| State | PID | IID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CO | 142854 | HIL66Y | ADAMS 12 FIVE STAR SCHOOLS | HILLCREST ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3, 4 |
| PA | 917582 | ANN1B8 | ANNVILLE-CLEONA SD | ANNVILLE EL SCH | 3, 4, 5 |
| CA | 10016651 | ACH7EK | Achieve Charter School Of Paradise Inc. | Achieve Charter School Of Paradise Inc. | 4, 3 |
| VA | 1068926 | CRO1RP | Albemarle County | Crozet Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| NM | 1523469 | DOL6PY | Albuquerque Public Schools | Dolores Gonzales Elementary School | 5 |
| NM | 704012 | LON6PY | Albuquerque Public Schools | Longfellow Elementary School | 3 |
| NM | 704074 | NAV6PY | Albuquerque Public Schools | Navajo Elementary School | 5 |
| CA | 5341718 | BRO746 | Beaumont Unified | Brookside Elementary | 3, 5, 4 |
| KY | 380850 | GRA363 | Bellevue Independent | Grandview Elementary School | 3 |
| MA | 421129 | AYE05B | Beverly | Ayers/Ryal Side School | 4, 3 |
| MA | 421026 | CEN05B | Beverly | Centerville Elementary | 3 |
| MA | 421040 | COV05B | Beverly | Cove Elementary | 5, 3, 4 |
| MA | 421064 | HAN05B | Beverly | Hannah Elementary | 5, 4, 3 |
| MA | 421105 | NOR05B | Beverly | North Beverly Elementary | 3 |
| NH | 2045197 | BOW097 | Bow | Bow Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| MO | 556205 | MID514 | COLUMBIA 93 | MIDWAY HEIGHTS ELEM. | 5 |
| IA | 234744 | CAM42H | Camanche Community School District | Camanche Elementary | 4,3 |
| IA | 234720 | CAM42I | Camanche Community School District | Camanche Middle School | 5 |
| CA | 120741 | CAY77J | Cayucos Elementary | Cayucos Elementary | 4, 3 |
| IA | 11814810 | EKS42I | Central DeWitt School District | Central DeWitt Intermediate School | 4 |
| CA | 95263 | BUE6ZT | Centralia Elementary | Buena Terra Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 95299 | GEO6ZQ | Centralia Elementary | George B. Miller Elementary | 4, 5 |
| CA | 95304 | GHD6ZQ | Centralia Elementary | Glen H. Dysinger Sr. Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 95316 | LOS6ZQ | Centralia Elementary | Los Coyotes Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 95354 | SAN6ZQ | Centralia Elementary | San Marino Elementary | 3, 4 |
| CA | 110693 | PAR73B | Chula Vista Elementary | Parkview Elementary | 4 |
| IL | 280561 | PEI4OI | City of Chicago SD 299 | Peirce Elem Intl Studies School | 3, 4, 5 |
| NV | 4919934 | JOH6VR | Clark | Bass ES | 4, 5 |
| NV | 3328904 | CHA6VK | Clark | Hill ES | 3, 5 |
| NV | 5099472 | MER6VM | Clark | Iverson ES | 4 |
| NV | 4945505 | LUC6VM | Clark | Rogers ES | 4, 5, 3 |
| NV | 711986 | ROB6V9 | Clark | Taylor (Robert) ES | 4, 5, 3 |
| IA | 233441 | CLE3W2 | Clear Lake Community School District | Clear Creek Elementary School | 4,3 |
| CO | 11718618 | OAK66V | DENVER COUNTY 1 | OAKLAND ELEMENTARY | 5 |
| IA | 250475 | BLU42G | Davenport Community School District | Blue Grass Elementary School | 3, 4, 5 |
| IA | 250487 | BUC42O | Davenport Community School District | Buchanan Elementary School | 5, 4, 3 |
| IA | 250566 | GAR42O | Davenport Community School District | Garfield Elementary School | 3, 4, 5 |
| IA | 1529152 | MCK42O | Davenport Community School District | McKinley Elementary School | 5, 4, 3 |
| IA | 250695 | HAR42O | Davenport Community School District | Truman Elementary School | 3, 5, 4 |
| IA | 250786 | WAS420 | Davenport Community School District | Washington Elementary School | 5, 4, 3 |
| UT | 1063483 | SOU6HE | Davis District | South Clearfield School | 3 |
| UT | 1063603 | WAS6HD | Davis District | Wasatch School | 5 |
| IA | 236596 | AUD40G | Dubuque Community School District | Audubon Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 236601 | BRY40G | Dubuque Community School District | Bryant Elementary School | 3, 5, 4 |
| IA | 236625 | EIS40G | Dubuque Community School District | Eisenhower Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 236651 | HOO40G | Dubuque Community School District | Hoover Elementary School | 5, 3 |
| IA | 236716 | MAR40G | Dubuque Community School District | Marshall Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 236728 | PRE40G | Dubuque Community School District | Prescott Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 236730 | SAG40G | Dubuque Community School District | Sageville Elementary School | 4, 5 |
| IA | 230102 | NEW40W | Eastern Allamakee Community School District | New Albin Elementary School | 5, 4, 3 |
| IA | 246668 | ESS3ZF | Essex Community School District | Essex Elementary School | 4 |
| IL | 269359 | DRB4MV | Evanston CCSD 65 | Dr Bessie Rhodes Sch Global Studies | 5 |
| IL | 269385 | MAR4N8 | Evanston CCSD 65 | Dr ML King Jr Literary \& Fine Arts Sch | 5 |
| IL | 269476 | WAL4N8 | Evanston CCSD 65 | Walker Elem School | 5 |
| CO | 149618 | EVA68R | FALCON 49 | EVANS INTERNATIONAL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4, 5, 3 |

Table 14: Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset)

| State | PID | IID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| GA | 221890 | LIV2BD | GRIFFIN | LIVINGSTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3, 4 |
| GA | 4751718 | MID2BD | GRIFFIN | MIDDLE RIDGE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 5, 3, 4 |
| IL | 3388904 | WES4MQ | Glencoe SD 35 | West School | 3 |
| VA | 1075321 | BYR1S2 | Goochland County | Byrd Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| VA | 1075345 | G001S3 | Goochland County | Goochland Elementary | 3, 4 |
| VA | 1075383 | RAN1RZ | Goochland County | Randolph Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| UT | 1064580 | COT6HN | Granite District | Cottonwood School | 4 |
| UT | 1065091 | TWI6HN | Granite District | Twin Peaks School | 4 |
| NY | 773570 | VANOWM | HALF HOLLOW HILLS CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT | VANDERBILT ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| MO | 3245546 | HAN4VC | HANCOCK PLACE | HANCOCK PLACE ELEM. | 3 |
| VA | 4029694 | CAR1SS | Isle of Wight County | Carrollton Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 1077252 | CAR1SR | Isle of Wight County | Carrsville Elementary | 4, 5 |
| VA | 10003680 | WES1T3 | Isle of Wight County | Westside Elementary | 4 |
| VA | 1077290 | WIN1T8 | Isle of Wight County | Windsor Elementary | 3, 4 |
| VA, CA | 1077264, 113190 | HAR1T3, HAR73V | Isle of Wight County, San Diego Unified | Hardy Elementary | 3, 5, 3 |
| KY | 389870 | FTW35X | Kenton County | Ft Wright Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| KY | 389909 | RYL35X | Kenton County | Ryland Heights Elementary School | 3 |
| TX | 995417 | LYT60U | LYTLE ISD | LYTLE EL | 5, 3, 4 |
| CA | 71554 | GRO6ZZ | Long Beach Unified | Cleveland Elementary | 5, 4, 3 |
| CA | 3248342 | INT709 | Long Beach Unified | Jenny Oropeza Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 71841 | ABR709 | Long Beach Unified | Lincoln Elementary | 4, 5, 3 |
| CA | 72120 | MAR70A | Long Beach Unified | Twain Elementary | 5, 4, 3 |
| CA | 72170 | FRA709 | Long Beach Unified | Willard Elementary | 4, 5 |
| CA | 71877, 83179 | HEN709, LON6ZO | Long Beach Unified, Whittier City Elementary | Longfellow Elementary | 5, 4, 3, 3 |
| CA | 77998 | TUL71Q | Los Angeles Unified | Tulsa Street Elementary | 5, 4 |
| CA | 88648 | SIE783 | Madera Unified | Sierra Vista Elementary | 5 |
| TX | 1019949 | NIX612 | NIXON-SMILEY CI | NIXON SMILEY EL | 3 |
| GA | 211120 | DAV2DF | NORTHWEST GEORGIA | DAVIS ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 5 |
| NY | 770932 | HOW15A | ODESSA-MONTOUR CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT | HOWARD A HANLON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4, 5 |
| FL | 3400045 | CLA2IV | ORANGE | CLAY SPRINGS ELEMENTARY | 5 |
| NY | 719782 | OXF12G | OXFORD ACADEMY AND CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT | OXFORD ACADEMY MIDDLE SCHOOL | 5 |
| CA | 49862 | BEL7AT | Oakland Unified | Bella Vista Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 50160 | BUR7AS | Oakland Unified | Burckhalter Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 50196 | CHA7AS | Oakland Unified | Howard Elementary | 5 |
| NJ | 676087 | OCEOMU | Ocean City | Ocean City Primary School | 3 |
| UT | 11567677 | TAY6IG | Ogden City District | Taylor Canyon School | 3 |
| AZ | 40347 | SOL6K5 | Osborn Elementary District | Solano School | 5 |
| PA | 918598 | CET1EA | PARKLAND SD | CETRONIA SCH | 3, 4 |
| PA | 918603 | FOG1EA | PARKLAND SD | FOGELSVILLE SCH | 3, 4 |
| PA | 11550430 | JAI1E3 | PARKLAND SD | FRED J JAINDL ES | 3, 5, 4 |
| PA | 918615 | IRO1E3 | PARKLAND SD | IRONTON SCH | 4, 3 |
| PA | 918627 | KER1E6 | PARKLAND SD | KERNSVILLE SCH | 3, 5, 4 |
| PA | 918639 | KRA1EA | PARKLAND SD | KRATZER SCH | 3, 4 |
| PA | 918653 | PAR1EA | PARKLAND SD | PARKWAY MANOR SCH | 4, 3 |
| PA | 918665 | SCH1E7 | PARKLAND SD | SCHNECKSVILLE SCH | 5, 4, 3 |
| PA | 903062 | OSC1AA | PHILIPSBURG-OSCEOLA AREA SD | OSCEOLA MILLS EL SCH | 3 |
| MO | 5279490 | REE52P | REEDS SPRING R-IV | REEDS SPRING ELEM. | 4, 3 |
| VA | 1088536 | MON1UP | Roanoke City | Monterey Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 81353 | HUR72U | Rowland Unified | Hurley Elementary | 3 |
| PA | 925307 | ROY112 | SPRING-FORD AREA SD | ROYERSFORD EL SCH | 3 |
| AR | 4916906 | BER5M4 | SPRINGDALE SCHOOL DISTRICT | BERNICE YOUNG ELEMENTARY | 5 |
| AR | 10908030 | MON5M4 | SPRINGDALE SCHOOL DISTRICT | MONITOR ELEMENTARY | 4, 3 |
| CA | 94312 | OLI75B | Saddleback Valley Unified | Olivewood Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 94324 | RAL75B | Saddleback Valley Unified | Ralph A. Gates Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 94336 | SAN75D | Saddleback Valley Unified | San Joaquin Elementary | 5, 4, 3 |

Table 15: Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset)

| State | PID | IID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CA | 94348 | SAN75B | Saddleback Valley Unified | Santiago Elementary | 3, 5 |
| CA | 112548 | ADA73V | San Diego Unified | Adams Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 112598 | BAK73V | San Diego Unified | Baker Elementary | 4, 5 |
| CA | 1824988 | DOY73W | San Diego Unified | Doyle Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 113073 | FOS73W | San Diego Unified | Foster Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 113217 | HEA73W | San Diego Unified | Hearst Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 113243 | HOL73V | San Diego Unified | Holmes Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 1824990 | JER73X | San Diego Unified | Jerabek Elementary | 4, 3, 5 |
| CA | 113463 | LOM73U | San Diego Unified | Loma Portal Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 113475 | LON73V | San Diego Unified | Longfellow K-8 | 3 |
| CA | 113700 | OCE73U | San Diego Unified | Ocean Beach Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 113815 | ROL73V | San Diego Unified | Rolando Park Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 113841 | ROW73U | San Diego Unified | Rowan Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 113944 | SPR73W | San Diego Unified | Spreckels Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 1524047 | BAY77G | San Luis Coastal Unified | Baywood Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 121252 | LIL77L | San Miguel Joint Union | Lillian Larsen Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 128810 | POM7C1 | Santa Clara Unified | Pomeroy Elementary | 4 |
| MA | 4143824 | SIL053 | Silver Hill Horace Mann Charter (District) | Silver Hill Horace Mann Charter School | 3 |
| CA | 82424 | EDI6ZE | Torrance Unified | Edison Elementary | 5 |
| IA | 238001 | TUR40X | Turkey Valley Community School District | Turkey Valley Elementary School | 4,3 |
| GA | 220834 | MOU2GD | WEST GEORGIA | MOUNTAIN VIEW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 5 |
| GA | 220822 | UNI2C3 | WEST GEORGIA | UNITY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| WI | 1134599 | EIS43U | Wauwatosa | Eisenhower Elementary | 5 |
| WI | 1134654 | MAD43U | Wauwatosa | Madison Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| IA | 236041 | LAM40L | West Delaware County Community School District | Lambert Elementary School | 3 |
| CA | 83193 | LYD6ZO | Whittier City Elementary | Lydia Jackson Elementary | 3, 4 |
| CA | 83222 | ORA6ZO | Whittier City Elementary | Orange Grove Elementary | 4, 5 |

Table 16: Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset)

### 8.2 Control Schools

The following tables list the control schools and grades (matched control grades to treatment grades) used in the analysis.

| State | PID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TX | 4015344 | ABILENE ISD | THOMAS EL | 5 |
| CO | 1825023 | ADAMS 12 FIVE STAR SCHOOLS | CHERRY DRIVE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| CA | 65452 | Abc Unified | Carver (Charles J.) Elementary | 4 |
| IA | 235463 | Adel DeSoto Minburn Community School District | DeSoto Intermediate School | 3 |
| VA | 1083720 | Alexandria City | Charles Barrett Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 100739 | Alvord Unified | Allan Orrenmaa Elementary | 4 |
| IA | 251924 | Ames Community School District | Fellows Elementary School | 4 |
| NH | 662828 | Amherst | Clark-Wilkins School | 4 |
| KY | 1395975 | Anderson County | Emma B. Ward Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 102892 | Arcohe Union Elementary | Arcohe Elementary | 5 |
| IA | 4448272 | Atlantic Community School District | Schuler Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 4356576 | Auburn Union Elementary | Auburn Elementary | 5 |
| NY | 771625 | BATH CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT | DANA L LYON MIDDLE SCHOOL | 5 |
| IA | 1485726 | BCLUW Community School District | BCLUW Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 239940 | BCLUW Community School District | BCLUW Middle School | 5 |
| PA | 926571 | BETHLEHEM AREA SD | MILLER HEIGHTS EL SC | 4 |
| CA | 62175 | Bakersfield City | Longfellow Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 62216 | Bakersfield City | Myra A. Noble Elementary | 4 |
| IA | 252033 | Ballard Community School District | Ballard East Elementary | 3 |
| VA, IA | 1070448, 248915 | Bath County, Valley Community School District | Valley Elementary | 3, 4 |
| CA | 4745836 | Belmont-Redwood Shores Elementary | Sandpiper Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 67113 | Bonita Unified | Gladstone Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 4918370 | Botetourt County | Greenfield Elementary | 4 |
| VA | 1070797 | Botetourt County | Troutville Elementary | 5 |
| MA | 425230 | Brimfield | Brimfield Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 121525 | Brisbane Elementary | Panorama Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 66975 | Burbank Unified | Joaquin Miller Elementary | 4 |
| IA | 238312 | CAL Community School District | CAL Elementary School | 3 |
| PA | 4919257 | CENTRAL BUCKS SD | GROVELAND ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| PA | 910833 | CONNELLSVILLE AREA SD | BULLSKIN EL SCH | 3 |
| AR | 31176 | COSSATOT RIVER SCHOOL DISTRICT | WICKES ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| PA | 897657 | COUNCIL ROCK SD | CHURCHVILLE EL SCH | 4 |
| PA | 897724 | COUNCIL ROCK SD | ROLLING HILLS EL SCH | 5 |
| PA | 904573 | CUMBERLAND VALLEY SD | SILVER SPRING EL SCH | 5 |
| UT | 1062752 | Cache District | Lincoln School | 5 |
| UT | 3008128 | Canyons District | Lone Peak School | 4 |
| IA | 4843660 | Carroll Community School District | Adams Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 230798 | Cedar Falls Community School District | Orchard Hill Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 243082 | Cedar Rapids Community School District | Erskine Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 233879 | Cherokee Community School District | Cherokee Middle School | 5 |
| IL | 275750 | City of Chicago SD 299 | Grissom Elem School | 3 |
| IL | 275944 | City of Chicago SD 299 | Kellogg Elem School | 5 |
| IA | 255918 | Clarion-Goldfield-Dows Community School District | Clarion-Goldfield-Dows Elementary School | 3 |
| NV | 4747248 | Clark | Cartwright ES | 4 |
| NV | 3401623 | Clark | Kahre ES | 5 |
| NV | 1544671 | Clark | Long ES | 5 |
| NV | 4872336 | Clark | Neal ES | 5 |
| NV | 3328851 | Clark | Perkins (Ute) ES | 3 |
| NV | 1399050 | Clark | Smith (Helen) ES | 4 |
| IA | 240808 | Clear Creek Amana Community School District | Amana Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 2225517 | Clovis Unified | Mountain View Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 3399202 | Colton Joint Unified | Jurupa Vista Elementary | 5 |
| WI | 1120110 | Columbus | Columbus Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 249373 | Council Bluffs Community School District | Edison Elementary School | 5 |
| CA | 95380 | Cypress Elementary | A. E. Arnold Elementary | 5 |

Table 17: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

ST Math is created by
MIND Research Institute
www.mindresearch.org

| State | PID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| PA | 926260 | DANVILLE AREA SD | LIBERTY-VALLEY EL SC | 4 |
| AR | 36281 | DANVILLE SCHOOL DISTRICT | S.C. TUCKER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| CO | 147359 | DENVER COUNTY 1 | SWANSEA ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 5 |
| CA | 90835 | Delhi Unified | El Capitan Elementary | 5 |
| IA | 247715 | Des Moines Independent Community School District | Capitol View Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 248070 | Des Moines Independent Community School District | Lovejoy Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 248202 | Des Moines Independent Community School District | Moulton Elementary School | 5, 4 |
| IA | 248331 | Des Moines Independent Community School District | Stowe Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 248343 | Des Moines Independent Community School District | Studebaker Elementary School | 3 |
| CA | 3399525 | Dixon Unified | Tremont Elementary | 3 |
| MA | 429377 | Dracut | Brookside Elementary | 5 |
| UT | 1065845 | Duchesne District | East School | 3 |
| PA | 918380 | EAST PENN SD | JEFFERSON EL SCH | 3 |
| PA | 918445 | EAST PENN SD | SHOEMAKER EL SCH | 3 |
| NY | 719275 | ELMIRA CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT | HENDY AVENUE SCHOOL | 4 |
| IA | 250334 | East Sac County Community School District | East Sac County Elementary Wall Lake | 4 |
| CA | 68777 | East Whittier City Elementary | Orchard Dale Elementary | 3 |
| NV | 712813 | Elko | Carlin Elementary School | 5 |
| GA | 3327235 | FIRST DISTRICT | SCREVEN COUNTY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| MA | 416502 | Falmouth | East Falmouth Elementary | 4 |
| KY | 383462 | Fayette County | Sandersville Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 4937895 | Folsom-Cordova Unified | Mather Heights Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 107725 | Fontana Unified | Juniper Elementary | 5 |
| IL | 320771 | Freeport SD 145 | Center Elem School | 4 |
| CA | 57443 | Fresno Unified | Ericson Elementary | 5 |
| CO | 150447 | GARFIELD RE-2 | RIVERSIDE SCHOOL | 5 |
| PA | 10900818 | GREAT VALLEY SD | SUGARTOWN ELEM SCHOOL | 4 |
| NM | 4871734 | Gallup-Mckinley Cty Schools | Tobe Turpen Elementary School | 5 |
| CA | 96669 | Garden Grove Unified | Sunnyside Elementary | 4 |
| MA | 427501 | Gateway | Littleville Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 238908 | Gladbrook-Reinbeck Community School District | Gladbrook-Reinbeck Elementary School | 5 |
| AZ | 2107238 | Glendale Elementary District | Horizon School | 5 |
| CA | 52455 | Golden Feather Union Elementary | Concow Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 62955 | Greenfield Union | Plantation Elementary | 5 |
| NH | 664840 | Greenland | Greenland Central School | 3 |
| PA | 907214 | HAVERFORD TOWNSHIP SD | LYNNEWOOD EL SCH | 3 |
| GA | 3329075 | HEART OF GEORGIA | SOUTH DODGE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 5 |
| PA | 940565 | HEMPFIELD AREA SD | WEST POINT EL SCH | 3, 4 |
| CA | 64472 | Hanford Elementary | Joseph M. Simas | 4 |
| IA | 252875 | Harmony Community School District | Harmony Elementary School | 5 |
| CA | 1169233 | Hayward Unified | Treeview Elementary | 5 |
| VA | 1076337 | Henrico County | Seven Pines Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 2110493 | Hesperia Unified | Kingston Elementary | 3 |
| IL | 290097 | Hinsdale CCSD 181 | The Lane Elem School | 3 |
| CO | 152938 | IGNACIO 11 JT | IGNACIO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| CO | 151386 | JEFFERSON COUNTY R-1 | DEANE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| TX | 11452280 | JUDSON ISD | JAMES L MASTERS | 3 |
| CA | 65127 | Janesville Union Elementary | Janesville Elementary | 5 |
| PA | 920527 | LAKE-LEHMAN SD | LEHMAN-JACKSON EL SC | 4 |
| FL | 194352 | LEE | PINE ISLAND ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 5 |
| CA | 111568 | La Mesa-Spring Valley | Fletcher Hills Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 111647 | La Mesa-Spring Valley | Lemon Avenue Elementary | 4, 3 |
| CA | 111673 | La Mesa-Spring Valley | Northmont Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 4030825 | Lake Elsinore Unified | Tuscany Hills Elementary | 4 |
| IA | 254328 | Lake Mills Community School District | Lake Mills Elementary School | 3 |
| NM | 1171925 | Las Cruces Public Schools | Booker T. Washington Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 254653 | Lawton-Bronson Community School District | Bronson Elementary School | 3 |
| VA | 1077707 | Lee County | St. Charles Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 1170074 | Lodi Unified | George Washington Elementary | 4, 5 |
| CA | 1170012 | Lodi Unified | Victor Elementary | 5 |

Table 18: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

| State | PID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CA | 1170270 | Lodi Unified | Vinewood Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 78136 | Los Angeles Unified | Capistrano Avenue Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 72651 | Los Angeles Unified | Denker Avenue Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 73332 | Los Angeles Unified | Loma Vista Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 76487 | Los Angeles Unified | San Pascual Elementary Science Technology Engineer | 4 |
| CA | 78497 | Los Angeles Unified | Serrania Avenue Charter For Enriched Studies | 4 |
| VA | 2110778 | Loudoun County | Leesburg Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 2896104 | Louisa County | Trevilians Elementary | 3 |
| MA | 425577 | Ludlow | Chapin Street Elementary School | 3 |
| TX | 1002245 | MARATHON ISD | MARATHON INDEPE | 3 |
| GA | 216417 | METRO | CAMPBELL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 5 |
| GA | 1528952 | METRO | CEDAR GROVE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| GA | 5273159 | METRO | KIPP SOUTH FULTON ACADEMY SCHOOL | 5 |
| GA | 212291 | METRO | ROCK CHAPEL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| MO | 554946 | MEXICO 59 | HAWTHORNE ELEM. | 3 |
| IA | 231467 | Madrid Community School District | Madrid Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 10002595 | Manteca Unified | Veritas Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 52558 | Manzanita Elementary | Manzanita Elementary | 3 |
| KY | 393285 | Marshall County | Benton Elementary School | 3 |
| MA | 431564 | Melrose | Lincoln | 3 |
| CA | 122294 | Menlo Park City Elementary | Encinal Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 135540 | Modesto City Elementary | John Fremont Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 3004330 | Mother Lode Union Elementary | Indian Creek Elementary | 4 |
| IA | 240250 | Mount Pleasant Community School District | Van Allen Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 246008 | Muscatine Community School District | Jefferson Elementary School | 3 |
| NY | 749971 | NEW YORK CITY GEOGRAPHIC DISTRICT \#31 | STEPHANIE A VIERNO SCHOOL (THE) | 5 |
| PA | 924781 | NORTH PENN SD | KNAPP EL SCH | 5 |
| GA | 218570 | NORTHWEST GEORGIA | BUCHANAN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| UT | 1876955 | Nebo District | Barnett School | 3 |
| KY | 394447 | Nelson County | The New Haven School | 3 |
| WI | 1147429 | New Berlin | Poplar Creek Elementary | 5 |
| IL | 271778 | Niles ESD 71 | Clarence E Culver School | 5 |
| MA | 4282183 | North Middlesex | Spaulding Memorial | 3 |
| MA | 1171195 | Northampton | Jackson Street | 3 |
| CA | 2896142 | Norwalk-La Mirada Unified | Cesar Chavez Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 79831 | Norwalk-La Mirada Unified | La Pluma Elementary | 5 |
| NV | 3006352 | Nye | Johnson ES | 3 |
| TX | 1007752 | OGLESBY ISD | OGLESBY SCHOOL | 4 |
| WI | 1137814 | Oconto Falls Public | Abrams Elementary | 4 |
| IA | 11931652 | Ottumwa Community School District | Liberty Elementary School | 3 |
| MO | 579362 | PARKWAY C-2 | RIVER BEND ELEM. | 5 |
| PA | 916590 | PENN MANOR SD | LETORT EL SCH | 3 |
| PA | 898089 | PENNRIDGE SD | DEIBLER SCHOOL | 3 |
| PA | 898156 | PENNRIDGE SD | SELLERSVILLE SCHOOL | 4 |
| PA | 901703 | PHOENIXVILLE AREA SD | SCHUYLKILL EL SCH | 5 |
| NY | 738166 | PORT WASHINGTON UNION FREE SCHOOL DISTRICT | GUGGENHEIM ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| CA | 52766 | Paradise Unified | Ponderosa Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 80969 | Pomona Unified | Armstrong Elementary | 5 |
| PA | 10005080 | QUAKERTOWN COMMUNITY SD | LOUIS F PFAFF ELEM SCHOOL | 4 |
| AR | 11918791 | RESPONSIVE ED SOLUTIONS NW ARK CLASSICAL ACADEMY | NORTHWEST ARKANSAS CLASSICAL ACA | 5 |
| PA | 893273 | RIVERSIDE BEAVER COUNTY SD | RIVERSIDE EL SCH | 3 |
| CA | 4754253 | Redlands Unified | Cram Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 10001498 | Redlands Unified | Highland Grove Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 4752279 | Redwood City Elementary | Adelante Spanish Immersion | 4 |
| CA | 122579 | Redwood City Elementary | Clifford Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 122610 | Redwood City Elementary | Henry Ford Elementary | 5, 4 |
| CA | 2879156 | Ripon Unified | Weston Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 135916 | Riverbank Unified | California Avenue Elementary | 5 |
| VA | 1080895 | Roanoke County | Oak Grove Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 4873304 | Rocklin Unified | Twin Oaks Elementary | 4 |

Table 19: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

| State | PID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| IL | 301880 | Round Lake CUSD 116 | Indian Hill Elem School | 5 |
| VA | 1081409 | Russell County | Belfast Elk Garden Elementary | 4, 5 |
| PA | 917386 | SHENANGO AREA SD | SHENANGO EL SCH | 3 |
| PA | 11917539 | SOUTH FAYETTE TOWNSHIP SD | SOUTH FAYETTE INTERMEDIATE SCH | 4 |
| GA | 217576 | SOUTHWEST GEORGIA | SHIVER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| MO | 555275 | SOUTHWEST R-V | SOUTHWEST ELEM. | 4 |
| CO | 145569 | ST VRAIN VALLEY RE 1J | NORTHRIDGE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| CA | 104761 | Sacramento City Unified | Mark Twain Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 117263 | San Francisco Unified | King (Thomas Starr) Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 117407 | San Francisco Unified | San Francisco Community Alternative | 3 |
| CA | 128236 | San Jose Unified | Graystone Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 139003 | San Jose Unified | River Glen | 5 |
| NM | 709919 | Santa Fe Public Schools | Kearny Elementary School | 3 |
| CA | 123755 | Santa Maria-Bonita | Bonita Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 99001 | Savanna Elementary | Hansen Elementary | 4 |
| MA | 419669 | Seekonk | George R Martin | 3 |
| IL | 310726 | Sherrard CUSD 200 | Matherville Intermediate School | 5 |
| IA | 254885 | Sioux City Community School District | Hunt Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 254902 | Sioux City Community School District | Spalding Park Elementary | 4 |
| VA | 1082295 | Stafford County | Ferry Farm Elementary | 4 |
| VA | 2126258 | Stafford County | Garrisonville Elementary | 5 |
| VA | 1088770 | Staunton City | Arthur R. Ware Elementary | 3 |
| WI | 1121970 | Sun Prairie Area | Northside Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 136099 | Sylvan Union Elementary | Sherwood Elementary | 5 |
| VA | 1082740 | Tazewell County | Tazewell Elementary | 5 |
| IA | 248733 | Urbandale Community School District | Jensen Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 10002600 | Val Verde Unified | Avalon Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 5279830 | Val Verde Unified | Sierra Vista Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 3006596 | Valley Center-Pauma Unified | Valley Center Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 1882124 | Virginia Beach City | Indian Lakes Elementary | 4 |
| VA | 3012313 | Virginia Beach City | Rosemont Forest Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 1528536 | Virginia Beach City | Salem Elementary | 4 |
| NV | 713697 | WCSD | Peavine ES | 4 |
| NV | 713829 | WCSD | Stead ES | 4 |
| NV | 4285836 | WCSD | Winnemucca ES | 3 |
| MO | 564666 | WEAUBLEAU R-III | WEAUBLEAU ELEM. | 3 |
| PA | 901911 | WEST CHESTER AREA SD | EAST GOSHEN EL SCH | 3 |
| MA | 433172 | Waltham | Douglas MacArthur Elementary School | 5 |
| CA | 5098818 | Washington Unified | Bridgeway Island Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 231168 | Waterloo Community School District | Kittrell Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 231170 | Waterloo Community School District | Lincoln Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 231156 | Waterloo Community School District | Lou Henry Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 231895 | Waverly-Shell Rock Community School District | Waverly-Shell Rock Middle School | 5 |
| IA | 253855 | Wayne Community School District | Wayne Elementary School | 5 |
| UT | 2222838 | Weber District | Midland School | 4 |
| IA | 239110 | West Central Valley Community School District | Stuart Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 244268 | West Lyon Community School District | West Lyon Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 240975 | Williamsburg Community School District | Mary Welsh Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 246163 | Wilton Community School District | Wilton Elementary School | 4 |
| MA | 434085 | Woburn | Linscott-Rumford | 3 |
| NJ | 690643 | Woodbridge Twp | Port Reading School | 3 |
| CA | 1530840 | Woodland Joint Unified | Zamora Elementary | 5 |
| VA | 1083586 | York County | Dare Elementary | 3 |

Table 20: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)


[^0]:    ${ }^{1 *}$ statistically significant $\mathrm{p}<0.05$

