# USA Math Outcomes Analysis 2018/19 

Grade Levels: 3, 4, 5<br>ST Math Program: Gen-4<br>Analysis Type: Z-score of math proficiency<br>Treatment-Years: 2017/18, 2018/19<br>Baseline-Year: 2016/17<br>Subgroup: All

## Jessica Guise

(C) 2020-03-26


#### Abstract

This analysis evaluates grades using ST Math in the USA in 2018/19. It identifies those grades with nominal or better implementation of the ST Math program, and matches them to randomly selected, similar math-performance comparison grades. The nominal ST Math users are an aggregation of 263 grades, consisting of grades 3,4 , and 5 at 178 schools, with an average baseline z-score of 0.14 . Refer to Figures 2 and 3 for the math performance and demographic distributions. They were matched to 263 similar, randomly selected control grades at 257 schools that never used ST Math. Grade-wise growth in math proficiency was evaluated (i.e. growth in same grade, same school, from 2016/17 to 2018/19) on the mean $z$-scores of percent Proficient or Advanced (see Section 3.1). Grades 3, 4, and 5 aggregated showed an ST Math effect of 0.27 z-score points.


## Contents

1 Introduction ..... 5
1.1 Background ..... 5
1.2 Program Description ..... 5
2 Data Collection ..... 6
2.1 Treatment Grades Pool and Selection ..... 6
2.1.1 Enrollment Filter ..... 6
2.1.2 Content Coverage Filter ..... 6
2.2 Control Grades Pool and Selection ..... 6
3 Data Analysis ..... 8
3.1 Z-scores ..... 8
3.2 Percentile Ranking ..... 8
3.3 Final Treatment and Control ..... 9
3.3.1 ST Math Grade-Aggregated Implementation ( $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment Grades Only) ..... 9
3.3.2 Filtering Treatment and Controls ..... 10
3.3.3 Match of Controls to Treatment ..... 11
3.4 Grade-Aggregated Analysis ..... 13
3.5 Grade-Level Analysis ..... 15
3.5.1 Grade Level Result Tables ..... 15
3.5.2 Grade-Level Analysis of Changes in Z-scores of Proficient or Advanced ..... 16
4 Effect Size ..... 17
5 Findings Summary ..... 17
6 Confounders ..... 17
7 Reference Tables Grouped By School Year ..... 18
8 Lists of Schools ..... 19
8.1 Treatment Schools ..... 19
8.2 Control Schools ..... 22

## List of Figures

1 Histogram of ST Math Percent Progress for $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment Grades 2018/19 ..... 9
2 Baseline Year Density Plots Showing Math Scores and Percent Student Need Match between TRT and CTRL - 2016/17 ..... 11
3 Changes in z-scores (See Section 3.1) for Grade-Aggregated TRT and CTRL datasets between 2016/17 and 2018/19 ..... 13
4 Changes in Percentile Ranking for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2016/17 and 2018/19 ..... 14
5 Changes in Grade-Mean Z-score (See Section 3.1) for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2016/17 and 2018/19 ..... 16

## List of Tables

1 Descriptive Statistics of ST Math Percent Progress for $>=85$ percent Enrollment Grades ..... 9
2 Number of ST Math Grades with $>=85$ percent Enrollment and with $>=40$ percent progress ..... 9
3 Treatment Pool Filtering and Controls: Counts of Grades, Schools, and Students ..... 10
4 Matching TRT and CTRL ..... 12
5 All Grades Together Growth ..... 13
6 Statistics for the Differential Changes in Math Scores Growth (TRT - CTRL) ..... 14
7 Grade 3 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets ..... 15
8 Grade 4 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets ..... 15
9 Grade 5 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets ..... 15
10 Statistics for the Differential Changes in Z-scores (See Section 3.1) Growth, (TRT - CTRL) ..... 16
11 Cohen's d Effect Size ..... 17
12 TRT Grades Detail Sorted by Year ..... 18
13 CTRL Grades Detail Sorted by Year ..... 18
14 Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset) ..... 19
15 Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset) ..... 20
16 Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset) ..... 21
17 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 22
18 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 23
19 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 24
20 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 25
21 Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset) ..... 26

## 1 Introduction

### 1.1 Background

This is a quasi-experimental analysis at the grade-mean level. Entire grades represent the units of analysis, and outcome measures are the 2 -year changes in grade-mean z-score of Proficient or Advanced. The treatment grades used the ST Math program for 2 years, beginning in the 2017/18 school year. The study hypothesis is treatment grades using ST Math will outperform similar matched control grades, using their "business as usual" conditions of instructional content and professional development. The control grades were selected to have similar demographic and math attributes (See Figures 2 and 3) to the treatment grades during the baseline year (2016/17), and did not use ST Math in 2017/18 or 2018/19. The treatment grades' selection pool was all schools using ST Math in grades 3, 4, and 5 in the USA. The control grades' pool was all schools not using ST Math in grades 3, 4, and 5 in the USA. This study method measures effectiveness of the ST Math program when nominally implemented.

### 1.2 Program Description

Spatial-Temporal Math (ST Math) is game-based, instructional software for K-12 students, created by the MIND Research Institute (MIND). The purpose of the program is to boost math comprehension through visual learning. The ST Math software games begin without language or symbol abstractions by posing math problems as purely visual puzzles. In this way, three objectives are accomplished: i) language proficiency prerequisites to engage with the program are minimal, ii) non-mathematical distractions (e.g. back-stories for word problems) are minimized or eliminated - thereby reducing load on working memory, and iii) the actual math in the problem can be represented clearly, simply, and unambiguously. Interactive, animated visual manipulatives provide informative feedback on student solutions. A score of 100 percent on a game level comprised of 4-12 puzzles is required for progression through the levels. Failure requires a re-play of the level, via a new quasi-random set of puzzles. In this way, progression is self-paced.

Besides the self-paced progress made by students in their one-to-one environment, the program is designed to be referenced by teachers during their regular math instruction. It is supplemental to core or basal math instruction and instructional materials. As the great majority of grade-level math standards are covered in the ST Math digital curriculum, completion of $100 \%$ of the entire ST Math curriculum (i.e. completing every Game) is required to cover all grade-level math standards. Teachers receive initial training, either face to face or through self-guided online instruction. The training covers account startup, as well as math learning and growth mindset goals, the pedagogical approach to learning in a visual experiential game, monitoring and intervention of the student 1:1 game play, and connecting of ST Math content to classroom content and pacing.

For students to achieve nominal progress through the program, there is a recommended time-on-task requirement of 90 minutes per week over about 30 weeks. Consistent application of 90 minutes per week throughout the school year is normally sufficient to result in a grade's average ST Math content coverage exceeding $50 \%$ by year-end. In this study, we include grades that have achieved $40 \%$ or more content coverage (Progress) by April 15th.

This is a passive study with no experimental setup or extraordinary communications to any schools. All schools in this study therefore received normal program implementation support through the year from MIND support managers. This support includes bundled startup services of approximately 2-4 hours of training either in-person or online, access to live webinars, regular online and push reports on usage and progress, email/phone helpdesk, and proactive monitoring for gaps or issues by MIND support representatives.

MIND Research Institute initiated, funded, and exercised editorial control over this study.

## 2 Data Collection

Since this analysis uses grades as the unit of analysis, and states publish grade-mean state standardized test scores, the data for student math outcomes is collected from each state education agency's research files (retrieved from state websites). The treatment students use ST Math student accounts served by MIND. Student ST Math usage data is aggregated to grade-level means by MIND.

### 2.1 Treatment Grades Pool and Selection

The Treatment grades pool originated with all schools and grades using ST Math in the USA. From these schools, every grade that had used the ST Math program only for the year 2018/19 was identified. They comprise the Treatment grades pool for this evaluation of 2-year usage.

### 2.1.1 Enrollment Filter

Because the analysis uses grade-mean data, such as grade-mean scale scores or grade-mean proficiency level percentages, it is necessary that the program also be a grade-wide treatment, with the great majority of students in each grade receiving treatment. Otherwise, the grade-means reported by the state of $100 \%$ of tested students would not be valid measures of a smaller fraction of treatment students. MIND's site implementation requirement is that an entire grade, including all teachers and all classes within that grade, use the ST Math program. We validate how closely this is the case for each individual treatment grade by comparing the number of ST Math student accounts at a grade level to the reported enrollment at that grade level. We discard from the Treatment pool any grade with a ratio of ST Math student accounts to reported grade enrollment lower than $85 \%$.

### 2.1.2 Content Coverage Filter

Furthermore, the outcomes measure is a summative year-end test, i.e. the standardized math assessment of that state. The math assessment thus covers all the math standards for that entire grade level. Meanwhile, the ST Math program curriculum (arranged into Learning Objectives) is also aligned to each state's math standards. To infer that the ST Math content is having a valid effect on student outcomes on the summative assessment, we discard any grade with grade-mean of ST Math Progress for its students lower than $40 \%$ by April.

Progress is a percentage, and is defined as Levels completed by the student, divided by the total number of Levels in the grade-level curriculum. Note that student achievement of at least $40 \%$ progress in ST Math is accomplished primarily by teacher assignment of computer session time to students. With sufficient time on task, students make progress. The program helps them self-pace through providing real-time informative feedback for each puzzle.

### 2.2 Control Grades Pool and Selection

The control grades are randomly selected from a control pool of schools in the USA. Though they are randomly selected, they are also matched to be similar to the Treatment grades' math attributes and demographics during the baseline 2016/17 year. The matched attributes include:

- z-score of percent Proficient or Advanced
- percentage of students receiving free or reduced lunch (using the demographic data from MDR).

To mitigate the risk of randomly picking a set of Control grades that generates an outlier for effect, a Monte Carlo approach is used to perform many random picks. The control pool's size is large enough that there are many possible "picks" of closely matched control grades.

One hundred randomly matched picks are made and sets of matched control grades are generated. For each set, the quality of the match as well as the math growth of the potential control set is evaluated. Some picked sets have high average math growth, some have low average math growth. From the set of all picks, a median pick is chosen. This avoids either an unlikely overestimate, or underestimate, of the Control grades' growth. When multiple median picks exist, the control set with the minimal math score differences in the baseline year is chosen.

## 3 Data Analysis

The set of all schools and grades using ST Math in the USA is evaluated for Enrollment percentage and Progress percentage parameters. A filtered Treatment set (TRT) of all ST Math grades with $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment and $\geq 40 \%$ Progress is identified. State math assessment data is tabulated. A matching set of Control grades based on baseline year state math assessment is selected.

Changes in math performance, i.e. the difference in math performance of a grade from a baseline year to the final year, are evaluated and tabulated. Statistical tests of the significance of the difference in math performance changes between Treatment grades and Control grades are performed. Finally, a grade-by-grade disaggregation is performed.

### 3.1 Z-scores

In order to analyze across all states with different math assessments, a new z-score of that test's math proficiency is calculated. For each year being analyzed, by grade, a z-score takes the difference of the grade mean percent proficient and the mean of all percent proficient statewide for that year, and then divides it by the standard deviation of all percent proficient statewide for that year. Here is a fictional example to illustrate the calculation of a z-score for the 2015/16 exam:

## School A, Grade 3, Percent Proficient: 70

Average across all schools statewide, Grade 3: 50
Standard deviation across all schools statewide, Grade 3: 20
Z-score $=(($ School A, Grade 3, Percent Proficient)-(Average across all schools, Grade 3))/(Standard deviation across all schools, Grade 3)

$$
\text { Z-score }=\frac{70-50}{20}=1
$$

The $z$-score is calculated for every grade across all years being analyzed, using the full state data set of schools for the averages and standard deviations. The use of z-scores is a valid statistical method to normalize any dataset and to enable analysis across otherwise uncomparable exams. In this report, we only analyze z-scores.

### 3.2 Percentile Ranking

These newly calculated z-scores can then be converted into a percentile ranking. Each percentile ranking shows the grade's performance relative to the others in that year and grade. For example, for a specific grade 3, a percentile ranking of 50 shows that this grade 3 performed at the average of all third grades in the state for that testing year.

### 3.3 Final Treatment and Control

### 3.3.1 ST Math Grade-Aggregated Implementation ( $\geq \mathbf{8 5 \%}$ Enrollment Grades Only)

## ST Math Percent Grade Mean Progress Distribution - 2018/19



Figure 1: Histogram of ST Math Percent Progress for $\geq 85 \%$ Enrollment Grades 2018/19
For all ST Math grades with Enrollment $\geq 85 \%$, Figure 1 shows the frequency distribution of gradeaverage Progress percentage through the program. Note that we will only be using grades with $\geq 40 \%$ Progress as the Treatment Group.

Table 1 provides descriptive statistics of the Progress distribution. Table 2 shows the number of remaining treatment grades after applying enrollment and progress filters.

|  | Min. | Max. | Average | S.D. |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| ST Math \% Progress | 0.0 | 95.9 | 33.4 | 17.7 |

Table 1: Descriptive Statistics of ST Math Percent Progress for $>=85$ percent Enrollment Grades

| Grades with $>=85 \%$ Enrollment: | 765 |
| ---: | :---: |
| Grades with in addition $>=40 \%$ Progress: | 263 |

Table 2: Number of ST Math Grades with $>=85$ percent Enrollment and with $>=40$ percent progress

### 3.3.2 Filtering Treatment and Controls

Table 3 shows the total number of grades in the Treatment pool, the number of grades that exceeded the $85 \%$ Enrollment figure, and also the $40 \%$ Progress filter. Other rows in the table indicate counts of numbers of students (2018/19 from state testing count) and counts of number of schools represented. The number of matched Control (CTRL) grades, students, and schools is also shown.

|  | Grade 3 | Grade 4 | Grade 5 | Total |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ST Math Using Grades | 451 | 348 | 400 | 1199 |
| ST Math Using Schools | 451 | 348 | 400 | 731 |
| ST Math Students | 34196 | 27243 | 32060 | 93499 |
| ST Math Grades (Enroll $>=85 \%$ ) | 288 | 214 | 263 | 765 |
| TRT Grades (Enroll $>=85 \%$ \& Prog $>=40 \%)$ | 108 | 82 | 73 | 263 |
| TRT Schools (Enroll $>=85 \%$ \& Prog $>=40 \%)$ | 108 | 82 | 72 | 178 |
| TRT Students (Enroll $>=85 \%$ \& Prog $>=40 \%)$ | 9709 | 7325 | 6468 | 23502 |
| CTRL Grades | 108 | 82 | 73 | 263 |
| CTRL Schools | 108 | 82 | 73 | 257 |
| CTRL Students | 8446 | 6644 | 5423 | 20513 |

Table 3: Treatment Pool Filtering and Controls: Counts of Grades, Schools, and Students

### 3.3.3 Match of Controls to Treatment

Figure 2 shows the density plots of the baseline $z$-score of percent students at state assessment Proficient or Advanced (left plot) and the percentage of students needing free or reduced lunch (right plot) for treatment grades overlayed on control grades, showing the closeness of the match obtained between Treatment and Control sets of grades in the baseline year, 2016/17.


Figure 2: Baseline Year Density Plots Showing Math Scores and Percent Student Need Match between TRT and CTRL - 2016/17

Table 4 shows the difference of the means of Treatment versus Control in the baseline year, with accompanying p-values, for mean z-score of percent Proficient or Advanced and for percent of students receiving free or reduced lunch. The large $p$-values show the differences between the Treatment and Control grades are not statistically significant.

|  | Mean(TRT) | SD(TRT) | Mean(CTRL) | SD(CTRL) | Estimate | P-Value | Effect Size |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced $-2016 / 17$ | 0.14 | 0.96 | 0.09 | 0.93 | 0.05 | 0.53 | 0.06 |
| Percent Free or Reduced Lunch | 49.63 | 27.46 | 49.69 | 28.05 | -0.06 | 0.98 | -0.00 |

Table 4: Matching TRT and CTRL

### 3.4 Grade-Aggregated Analysis

Table 5 shows for both Treatment (TRT) and Control (CTRL) aggregation across grades of z-score distributions. The far right column also shows the average ST Math Progress for the TRT set.

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Comp. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.16.17 | 263 | 178 | 21460 | 0.14 | 53.73 | - |
| TRT.18.19 | 263 | 178 | 20891 | 0.38 | 61.29 | 53.57 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.24 | 7.55 | - |
| CTRL.16.17 | 263 | 257 | 21004 | 0.09 | 52.37 | - |
| CTRL.18.19 | 263 | 257 | 20513 | 0.05 | 51.03 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | -0.04 | -1.34 | - |

Table 5: All Grades Together Growth
Figure 3 shows the changes in mean z-scores of percent Proficient or Advanced for the gradeaggregated Treatment and Control sets.

Changes in Z-scores - 2018/19 vs 2016/17


Figure 3: Changes in z-scores (See Section 3.1) for Grade-Aggregated TRT and CTRL datasets between 2016/17 and 2018/19

Further, Table 6 shows the statistics for the differences in changes between TRT and CTRL (Treatment - Control) for these same z -score changes as in the above figure. ${ }^{1}$

|  | Estimate | P-Value | Int.Low | Int. High |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Z-Score | 0.27 | $0.00^{*}$ | 0.17 | 0.38 |

Table 6: Statistics for the Differential Changes in Math Scores Growth (TRT - CTRL)
Finally, Figure 4 shows the changes in mean percentile ranking between TRT and CTRL.

## Mean Percentile Plot - TRT vs CTRL



Figure 4: Changes in Percentile Ranking for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2016/17 and 2018/19

[^0]
### 3.5 Grade-Level Analysis

### 3.5.1 Grade Level Result Tables

The following tables (Table 7, 8, and 9) present a disaggregation of results by grade level. The far right column in each table also shows the average ST Math Progress for the TRT set.

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Prog. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.16.17 | 108 | 108 | 8765 | 0.14 | 54.82 | - |
| TRT.18.19 | 108 | 108 | 8545 | 0.39 | 61.81 | 53.84 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.24 | 6.98 | - |
| CTRL.16.17 | 108 | 108 | 8478 | 0.08 | 53.22 | - |
| CTRL.18.19 | 108 | 108 | 8446 | 0.06 | 51.99 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | -0.02 | -1.23 | - |

Table 7: Grade 3 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Prog. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.16.17 | 82 | 82 | 6819 | 0.14 | 52.37 | - |
| TRT.18.19 | 82 | 82 | 6482 | 0.40 | 61.73 | 52.69 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.26 | 9.37 | - |
| CTRL.16.17 | 82 | 82 | 6887 | 0.10 | 51.12 | - |
| CTRL.18.19 | 82 | 82 | 6644 | 0.03 | 49.51 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | -0.07 | -1.61 | - |

Table 8: Grade 4 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Prog. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| TRT.16.17 | 73 | 72 | 5876 | 0.14 | 53.66 | - |
| TRT.18.19 | 73 | 72 | 5864 | 0.34 | 60.01 | 54.15 |
| TRT.Delta | - | - | - | 0.20 | 6.36 | - |
| CTRL.16.17 | 73 | 73 | 5639 | 0.09 | 52.51 | - |
| CTRL.18.19 | 73 | 73 | 5423 | 0.06 | 51.32 | - |
| CTRL.Delta | - | - | - | -0.03 | -1.19 | - |

Table 9: Grade 5 - Yearly Math Performance and Counts for TRT and CTRL Datasets

### 3.5.2 Grade-Level Analysis of Changes in Z-scores of Proficient or Advanced

Figure 5 shows the changes in the grade-mean $z$-scores of students for the TRT and CTRL datasets, disaggregated by grade:

## Changes in Z-score - 2018/19 vs 2016/17



Figure 5: Changes in Grade-Mean Z-score (See Section 3.1) for TRT and CTRL Datasets between 2016/17 and 2018/19

Table 10 shows the statistics for the differences between TRT and CTRL (Treatment - Control) for these same z -score changes as shown in Figure 5.

|  | Estimate | P-Value | Int.Low | Int.High |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Grade 3 | 0.26 | $0.00^{*}$ | 0.09 | 0.43 |
| Grade 4 | 0.33 | $0.00^{*}$ | 0.16 | 0.50 |
| Grade 5 | 0.23 | $0.02^{*}$ | 0.03 | 0.43 |

Table 10: Statistics for the Differential Changes in Z-scores (See Section 3.1) Growth, (TRT - CTRL)

## 4 Effect Size

The following table shows the effect sizes for $z$-score of Proficient or Advanced.

|  | Z-Score of Proficient or Advanced Effect Size |
| :--- | :---: |
| Grade 3 | 0.27 |
| Grade 4 | 0.36 |
| Grade 5 | 0.25 |
| All Grades | 0.29 |

Table 11: Cohen's d Effect Size

## 5 Findings Summary

USA grades 3, 4, and 5 using ST Math for the year 2018/19 averaged 27.6\% ST Math Progress. $308 / 1199$ grades ( $26 \%$ ) averaged covering more than $40 \%$ of ST Math content. Statistically significant differences were found in this analysis for both grade-aggregated and individual grade levels. Looking at Table 6, a statistically significant difference was found for grade-aggregated z-score, with an estimate of 0.27 points favorable for the ST Math treatment set. Looking at Table 10, grades 3, 4 and 5 ST math treatment sets outperformed their matched controls for state assessment z-scores with statistically significant differences of $0.26,0.33$ and 0.23 , respectively.

## 6 Confounders

Despite best efforts in minimizing confounders to the results of this analysis, there still remain a few input variables that could be significant in affecting differences of state test score outcomes between the Treatment and Control sets. One issue is the lack of randomization of grades chosen to receive the ST Math treatment. Instead of randomized selection, Treatment grades are self-selected. Self-selection can be an indication of districts or schools with a focus on math, an appetite for change, and with a spotlight on math training. Furthermore, not all grades using the ST Math program are chosen for analysis. Each grade must pass two specific filters to be considered for the Treatment set: the first being an enrollment filter of at least $85 \%$ of students in each grade using the program, and the second being a progress filter of at least $40 \%$ of the program completed on average by students in that grade. These filters might indicate relatively high-functioning schools with a team of relatively effective teachers in that grade, thus resulting in better instruction overall. A mitigation of this possible confounder is our selection of treatment groups on the grade level, rather than the teacher level, so there is no cherry picking of teachers: the full range of teachers in each grade is included. Moreover, the specific teachers may often be the same in the baseline year as in the current year, so the Treatment growth is not due to teacher differences. Finally, a possible confounder lies in the "business as usual" conditions at the matched control grades chosen for each analysis. It's unknown whether these control grades used other programs that could affect the comparison of the two sets of grades. The Monte Carlo Method is used to mitigate the possibility of control picks being favorable or unfavorable (see Section 2.3).

## 7 Reference Tables Grouped By School Year

The following tables show grade-level details, grouped by school year and for treatment (Table 12) and controls (Table 13) separately.

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Comp. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Grade 3 (16.17) | 108 | 108 | 8765 | 0.14 | 54.82 | - |
| Grade 4 (16.17) | 82 | 82 | 6819 | 0.14 | 52.37 | - |
| Grade 5 (16.17) | 73 | 72 | 5876 | 0.14 | 53.66 | - |
| All Grades (16.17) | 263 | 178 | 21460 | 0.14 | 53.73 | - |
| Grade 3 (18.19) | 108 | 108 | 8545 | 0.39 | 61.81 | 53.84 |
| Grade 4 (18.19) | 82 | 82 | 6482 | 0.40 | 61.73 | 52.69 |
| Grade 5 (18.19) | 73 | 72 | 5864 | 0.34 | 60.01 | 54.15 |
| All Grades (18.19) | 263 | 178 | 20891 | 0.38 | 61.29 | 53.57 |

Table 12: TRT Grades Detail Sorted by Year

|  | \# Grades | \# Schools | \# Students | Z-Score | Percentile | ST Math Per Comp. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Grade 3 (16.17) | 108 | 108 | 8478 | 0.08 | 53.22 | - |
| Grade 4 (16.17) | 82 | 82 | 6887 | 0.10 | 51.12 | - |
| Grade 5 (16.17) | 73 | 73 | 5639 | 0.09 | 52.51 | - |
| All Grades (16.17) | 263 | 257 | 21004 | 0.09 | 52.37 | - |
| Grade 3 (18.19) | 108 | 108 | 8446 | 0.06 | 51.99 | - |
| Grade 4 (18.19) | 82 | 82 | 6644 | 0.03 | 49.51 | - |
| Grade 5 (18.19) | 73 | 73 | 5423 | 0.06 | 51.32 | - |
| All Grades (18.19) | 263 | 257 | 20513 | 0.05 | 51.03 | - |

Table 13: CTRL Grades Detail Sorted by Year

## 8 Lists of Schools

### 8.1 Treatment Schools

The following tables list the treatment schools and grades (after 85\% enrollment and 40\% progress filtering) used in the analysis.

| State | PID | IID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| PA | 917582 | ANN1B8 | ANNVILLE-CLEONA SD | ANNVILLE EL SCH | 3 |
| NV | 5348089 | EVA6VC | Achievement | Eva G Simmons Elementary School | 4, 3, 5 |
| NV | 4038932 | HPFORS | Achievement | H P Fitzgerald Elementary School | 4, 3 |
| NV | 4019120 | JIMORS | Achievement | Jim Thorpe Elementary School | 5, 4, 3 |
| NV | 4919934 | JOH6VR | Achievement | John C. Bass Elementary School | 4, 3 |
| NV | 3274377 | JOHORT | Achievement | John F Mendoza Elementary School | 4 |
| NV | 711936 | OKA0RS | Achievement | O K Adcock Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| VA | 5098428 | BAK1RN | Albemarle County | Baker-Butler Elem | 3, 4 |
| VA | 1068897 | BRO1RP | Albemarle County | Broadus Wood Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| VA | 1068902 | BRO1RQ | Albemarle County | Brownsville Elementary | 4 |
| VA | 1068952 | HOL1RN | Albemarle County | Hollymead Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| VA | 1068990 | MER1RM | Albemarle County | Meriwether Lewis Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 130045 | ARO7BW | Aromas - San Juan Unified | Aromas | 4 |
| MA | 418093 | AIR07I | Attleboro | A. Irvin Studley Elementary School | 3 |
| MA | 418110 | THO07I | Attleboro | Thomas Willett Elementary School | 3 |
| CA | 66614 | ERN0RS | Bellflower Unified | Ernie Pyle Elementary | 3 |
| NJ | 2110807 | THO00G | Bethlehem Twp | Thomas B. Conley Elementary School | 3 |
| MA | 421026 | CEN05B | Beverly | Centerville Elementary | 4 |
| MA | 421040 | COV05B | Beverly | Cove Elementary | 4 |
| MA | 421105 | NOR05B | Beverly | North Beverly Elementary | 4 |
| MT | 2109171 | ALK4K6 | Billings Elem | Alkali Creek School | 4 |
| MT | 1828623 | ARR4K6 | Billings Elem | Arrowhead School | 3 |
| MT | 2891013 | BIG4K6 | Billings Elem | Big Sky Elementary | 5 |
| MT | 609280 | BOU4K6 | Billings Elem | Boulder School | 3, 5, 4 |
| MT | 609450 | POL4K6 | Billings Elem | Poly Drive School | 5, 3 |
| MA | 440230 | ELL05V | Boston | Ellis Mendell | 4 |
| VA | 1070723 | BREORS | Botetourt County | Breckinridge Elementary | 3, 4, 5 |
| MA | 428713 | FOX050 | Burlington | Fox Hill | 3 |
| MA | 428775 | FRA050 | Burlington | Francis Wyman Elementary | 3 |
| MA | 428751 | MEM050 | Burlington | Memorial | 3 |
| MA | 428763 | PIN050 | Burlington | Pine Glen Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 2852378 | OAKORU | Burton Elementary | Oak Grove Elementary | 3, 4 |
| TX | 1418254 | DAL0RS | CARROLLTON-FARM | DAVIS ELEM. | 5 |
| MO | 556085 | RUS514 | COLUMBIA 93 | RUSSELL BLVD. ELEM. | 4 |
| CA | 4291134 | BLO73M | Cajon Valley Union | Blossom Valley Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 110203 | BOS73M | Cajon Valley Union | Bostonia Language Academy | 3 |
| CA | 110265 | FLY73M | Cajon Valley Union | Flying Hills School of Arts | 5 |
| CA | 110277 | FUE73M | Cajon Valley Union | Fuerte Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 2129652 | VIS73L | Cajon Valley Union | Vista Grande Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 95160 | LAS0RS | Capistrano Unified | Las Palmas Elementary | 5, 3 |
| CA | 95263 | BUE6ZT | Centralia Elementary | Buena Terra Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 95316 | LOS6ZQ | Centralia Elementary | Los Coyotes Elementary | 4, 5 |
| CA | 95354 | SAN6ZQ | Centralia Elementary | San Marino Elementary | 4, 5 |
| IA | 233843 | ROO3XP | Cherokee CSD | Roosevelt Elementary School | 3 |
| IL | 277526 | GUN4OF | City of Chicago SD 299 | Gunsaulus Elem Scholastic Academy | 5 |
| IL | 280561 | PEI4OI | City of Chicago SD 299 | Peirce Elem Intl Studies School | 4, 3 |
| MI | 504680 | B0T3PR | Clarenceville School District | Botsford Elementary School | 5 |
| CO | 2179504 | FALORS | DISTRICT 49 | FALCON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL OF TECHNOLOGY | 3, 4 |
| CO | 4477687 | REM68S | DISTRICT 49 | REMINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| IA | 250463 | ADA0RT | Davenport CSD | Adams Elementary School | 3, 5 |
| IA | 250499 | BUFORS | Davenport CSD | Buffalo Elementary School | 3,5 |
| IA | 250530 | EISORS | Davenport CSD | Eisenhower Elementary School | 5, 3, 4 |
| IA | 250607 | HARORT | Davenport CSD | Harrison Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 250645 | JACORS | Davenport CSD | Jackson Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 250762 | WALORT | Davenport CSD | Walcott Elementary School | 4, 5 |

Table 14: Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset)

| State | PID | IID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| IA | 250815 | WILORW | Davenport CSD | Wilson Elementary School | 4, 3 |
| UT | 1063445 | OAK6HD | Davis District | Oak Hills School | 3 |
| UT | 12033461 | ODY6HK | Davis District | Odyssey School | 5 |
| UT | 1063562 | VAL6HD | Davis District | Valley View School | 3 |
| IA | 236601 | BRY40G | Dubuque CSD | Bryant Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 10902892 | GEO40G | Dubuque CSD | Carver Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 236663 | IRV40G | Dubuque CSD | Irving Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| IA | 236699 | JOH40G | Dubuque CSD | John Kennedy Elementary School | 5, 4 |
| IA | 236730 | SAG40G | Dubuque CSD | Sageville Elementary School | 5, 3 |
| IA | 236742 | TAB40G | Dubuque CSD | Table Mound Elementary School | 5 |
| TX | 5070141 | HIG0RT | EAST CENTRAL IS | HIGHLAND FOREST | 3 |
| IN | 339502 | EAS3K4 | Edinburgh Community School Corp | East Side Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 4915794 | ELC73K | Encinitas Union Elementary | El Camino Creek Elementary | 3 |
| OH | 1401110 | BRE3BQ | Fairfield Union Local | Bremen Elementary School | 3 |
| AZ | 5279311 | SANORT | Florence Unified School District | San Tan Heights Elementary | 4 |
| AZ | 10001527 | SKYORS | Florence Unified School District | Skyline Ranch Elementary School | 4, 3 |
| MO | 565751 | MEA4XV | GRANDVIEW C-4 | MEADOWMERE ELEM. | 3, 5 |
| GA | 10902945 | BET2C0 | GRIFFIN | BETHLEHEM ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 5, 4 |
| CA | 96097 | CLI75W | Garden Grove Unified | Clinton Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 96334 | JOH0RW | Garden Grove Unified | John Marshall Elementary | 3 |
| UT | 10030334 | GEAORS | Granite District | Gearld Wright School | 3, 4, 5 |
| UT | 1064839 | LAK0RS | Granite District | Lake Ridge School | 3 |
| UT | 1065209 | W006HO | Granite District | Woodstock School | 4 |
| MO | 3245546 | HAN4VC | HANCOCK PLACE | HANCOCK PLACE ELEM. | 5, 4 |
| TX | 1049279 | HEM5UY | HEMPHILL ISD | HEMPHILL ELEM. | 3, 4 |
| FL | 3319680 | DEL2O4 | HERNANDO | DELTONA ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 5, 3 |
| CA | 70495 | ZEL6YP | Hawthorne | Zela Davis | 5, 3 |
| OH | 3246112 | BRT3BI | Hilliard City | Britton Elementary School | 3 |
| OH | 801751 | BRN3BI | Hilliard City | Brown Elementary School | 3 |
| OH | 4945062 | HTE3BI | Hilliard City | Hoffman Trails Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 251479 | IRW3YW | IKM-Manning CSD | Irwin Elementary School | 3 |
| NJ | 684670 | GAROJJ | Kearny Town | Garfield Elementary School | 4, 3, 5 |
| CA | 3336511 | ALV703 | Long Beach Unified | Alvarado Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 71475 | ALI708 | Long Beach Unified | Birney Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 71487 | FLO709 | Long Beach Unified | Bixby Elementary | 3, 4 |
| CA | 71504 | BUR70A | Long Beach Unified | Burbank Elementary | 5, 4, 3 |
| CA | 71542 | GE0708 | Long Beach Unified | Carver Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 5345776 | CES708 | Long Beach Unified | Chavez Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 71554 | GRO6ZZ | Long Beach Unified | Cleveland Elementary | 5, 4 |
| CA | 71815 | LAF708 | Long Beach Unified | Lafayette Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 71889 | LOS708 | Long Beach Unified | Los Cerritos Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 71891 | LOW708 | Long Beach Unified | Lowell Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 71970 | MUI709 | Long Beach Unified | Muir K-8 | 3, 4 |
| CA | 71982 | NAP708 | Long Beach Unified | Naples Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 71750 | JAM6ZZ | Long Beach Unified | Riley Elementary | 4, 3 |
| CA | 72106 | TIN709 | Long Beach Unified | Tincher Preparatory | 3 |
| CA | 76231 | GAR0RT | Los Angeles Unified | Garvanza Elementary | 4, 5, 3 |
| CA | 77730 | HER71Q | Los Angeles Unified | Herrick Avenue Elementary | 5, 3 |
| CA | 11562419 | JAIORS | Los Angeles Unified | Jaime Escalante Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 10013702 | PANORS | Los Angeles Unified | Panorama City Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 77338 | RES71P | Los Angeles Unified | Reseda Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 73538 | STA0RS | Los Angeles Unified | State Street Elementary | 5, 3 |
| CA | 73019 | TOW702 | Los Angeles Unified | Towne Avenue Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 245042 | ANS3VB | Marshalltown CSD | Anson Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| IA | 245080 | FIS3VB | Marshalltown CSD | Fisher Elementary School | 4 |

Table 15: Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset)

| State | PID | IID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| IA | 245107 | FRA3VB | Marshalltown CSD | Franklin Elementary Sch | 3, 4 |
| IA | 245119 | JCH3VB | Marshalltown CSD | J C Hoglan Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 10804927 | LEN3VB | Marshalltown CSD | Lenihan Intermediate School | 5 |
| IA | 245157 | ROG3VB | Marshalltown CSD | Rogers Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 245171 | W003VB | Marshalltown CSD | Woodbury Elementary School | 3 |
| CT | 169644 | BENOHX | Meriden School District | Benjamin Franklin School | 5 |
| CT | 169670 | HANOHX | Meriden School District | Hanover School | 4 |
| CT | 169761 | THOOHX | Meriden School District | Thomas Hooker School | 4, 5 |
| MA | 1533684 | W0004V | Milford | Woodland | 3, 4 |
| WI | 1133155 | VIE43S | Milwaukee | Vieau Elementary | 4 |
| IL | 315544 | BIC4Q4 | Moline-Coal Valley CUSD 40 | Bicentennial Elem School | 3, 5, 4 |
| IL | 315594 | GEO4Q6 | Moline-Coal Valley CUSD 40 | George Washington Elem School | 5 |
| LA | 11918351 | BRI5ER | NA | BRICOLAGE ACADEMY | 3 |
| NY | 745925 | PS20RS | NEW YORK CITY GEOGRAPHIC DISTRICT \#17 | PS 289 GEORGE V BROWER | 5, 4, 3 |
| NY | 747143 | PS10VG | NEW YORK CITY GEOGRAPHIC DISTRICT \#22 | PS 119 AMERSFORT | 4, 5 |
| CT | 164345 | SMIOGT | New Britain School District | Smith Elementary School | 4 |
| NY | 719782 | OXF12G | OXFORD ACADEMY AND CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT | OXFORD ACADEMY MIDDLE SCHOOL | 5 |
| CA | 3048013 | MAG7CW | Oakdale Joint Unified | Magnolia Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 97663 | CIR0RS | Ocean View | Circle View Elementary | 4, 3, 5 |
| CA | 97869 | STA75D | Ocean View | Star View Elementary | 5, 4, 3 |
| PA | 918598 | CET1EA | PARKLAND SD | CETRONIA SCH | 3 |
| PA | 11550430 | JAI1E3 | PARKLAND SD | FRED J. JAINDL EL SCH | 3 |
| PA | 918615 | IRO1E3 | PARKLAND SD | IRONTON SCH | 5, 3 |
| PA | 918627 | KER1E6 | PARKLAND SD | KERNSVILLE SCH | 5, 4 |
| PA | 918639 | KRA1EA | PARKLAND SD | KRATZER SCH | 4, 3 |
| PA | 918653 | PAR1EA | PARKLAND SD | PARKWAY MANOR SCH | 3 |
| PA | 918665 | SCH1E7 | PARKLAND SD | SCHNECKSVILLE SCH | 3 |
| FL | 2854833 | CYP2OC | PINELLAS | CYPRESS WOODS ELEMENTARY SCHL | 4 |
| FL | 199912 | LEA0RS | PINELLAS | LEALMAN INNOVATION ACADEMY | 5 |
| FL | 199948 | MAD2LM | PINELLAS | MADEIRA BEACH FUNDAMENTAL K-8 | 3, 4 |
| FL | 200470 | TAR2OD | PINELLAS | TARPON SPRINGS FUNDAMENTAL ELE | 3, 4 |
| CA | 5347633 | LEO700 | Paramount Unified | Leona Jackson | 4 |
| MS | 595770 | NIC31M | Picayune School District | Nicholson Elementary School | 4, 5, 3 |
| CA | 102476 | HIG74Y | Riverside Unified | Highgrove Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 102555, 71877 | LON74Y, HEN709 | Riverside Unified, Long Beach Unified | Longfellow Elementary | 5, 3, 5 |
| VA | 1088407 | CRYORS | Roanoke City | Crystal Spring Elementary | 5 |
| VA | 1397143 | FAL1UP | Roanoke City | Fallon Park Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 1088457 | GRAORW | Roanoke City | Grandin Court Elementary | 5 |
| NJ | 694895 | THOOLU | Rockaway Boro | Thomas Jefferson Middle School | 5 |
| IL | 1540637 | LOR4N0 | SD U-46 | Lords Park Elem School | 3 |
| PA | 925307 | ROY112 | SPRING-FORD AREA SD | ROYERSFORD EL SCH | 3 |
| NY | 762442 | LEM100 | SYRACUSE CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT | LEMOYNE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| CA | 112885 | CUB73W | San Diego Unified | Cubberley Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 113217 | HEA73W | San Diego Unified | Hearst Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 1824990 | JER73X | San Diego Unified | Jerabek Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 5102536 | SCR73X | San Diego Unified | Scripps Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 113920 | SIL73U | San Diego Unified | Silver Gate Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 113944 | SPR73W | San Diego Unified | Spreckels Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 113970 | SUN73U | San Diego Unified | Sunset View Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 114065 | WAS73U | San Diego Unified | Washington Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 3329647 | DELORT | San Luis Coastal Unified | Del Mar Elementary | 3,5 |
| CA | 10001137 | CAP77K | San Miguel Joint Union | Cappy Culver Elementary | 5, 3 |
| CA | 121252 | LIL77L | San Miguel Joint Union | Lillian Larsen Elementary | 3, 4 |
| CA | 114443 | CEN73D | South Bay Union | Central Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 114455 | EMO73Z | South Bay Union | Emory Elementary | 3, 4 |
| CA | 114467 | GOD73Z | South Bay Union | Godfrey G. Berry Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 114493 | NES73Z | South Bay Union | Nestor Language Academy Charter | 3 |
| CA | 114508 | ONE73D | South Bay Union | Oneonta Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 114510 | SUN73Z | South Bay Union | Sunnyslope Elementary | 3 |
| UT | 5097515 | MID6HJ | Tooele District | Middle Canyon School | 4 |
| CA | 82345 | ANZ6ZE | Torrance Unified | Anza Elementary | 4, 3, 5 |
| CA | 82357 | ARL6ZE | Torrance Unified | Arlington Elementary | 3, 5, 4 |
| CA | 82369 | ARN6ZE | Torrance Unified | Joseph Arnold Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 82589 | SEA6ZE | Torrance Unified | Seaside Elementary | 4,5 |
| CA | 4014572 | BARORS | Tustin Unified | Barbara Benson Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 65000 | UPP7D8 | Upper Lake Unified | Upper Lake Elementary | 3, 4 |
| NY | 738881 | WILOUL | VALLEY STREAM 13 UNION FREE SCHOOL DISTRICT | WILLOW ROAD SCHOOL | 3 |
| MA | 436899 | FIS05S | Walpole | Fisher | 5 |

Table 16: Treatment Schools (TRT Dataset)

### 8.2 Control Schools

The following tables list the control schools and grades (matched control grades to treatment grades) used in the analysis.

| State | PID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CA | 65531 | ABC Unified | Gonsalves (Joe A.) Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 65490 | ABC Unified | Leal (Frank C.) Elementary | 4 |
| MS | 595017 | Aberdeen School District | Belle Shivers Middle School | 4 |
| NV | 3249205 | Achievement | Claude \& Stella Parson Elementary School | 4 |
| NV | 711560 | Achievement | George E Harris Elementary School | 3 |
| NV | 10030102 | Achievement | Imagine 100 Academy of Excellence | 4 |
| NV | 711663 | Achievement | J. E. Manch Elementary School | 3 |
| NV | 3402005 | Achievement | Jack Dailey Elementary School | 4 |
| NV | 4018920 | Achievement | Patricia A Bendorf Elementary School | 3 |
| NV | 5099496 | Achievement | Steve Cozine Elementary School | 4 |
| NV | 3328899 | Achievement | Walter Jacobson Elementary School | 3, 5 |
| MA | 4028559 | Acton-Boxborough | Merriam School | 3 |
| CA | 65725 | Alhambra Unified | Garfield Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 65775 | Alhambra Unified | Monterey Highlands Elementary | 5 |
| UT | 1067386 | Alpine District | Sego Lily School | 3 |
| CA | 100791 | Alvord Unified | La Granada Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 5102938 | Aspire River Oaks Charter | Aspire River Oaks Charter | 5 |
| PA | 892669 | BEAVER AREA SD | DUTCH RIDGE EL SCH | 5 |
| TX | 10003721 | BELTON ISD | CHISHOLM TRAIL | 5 |
| TX | 4028169 | BRIDGEPORT ISD | BRIDGEPORT INTE | 4 |
| FL | 4364535 | BROWARD | EAGLE RIDGE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| CA | 100894 | Banning Unified | Central Elementary | 3 |
| NJ | 677158 | Belleville Town | Belleville Ps4 | 3 |
| CA | 5351907 | Bert Corona Charter | Bert Corona Charter | 5 |
| MA | 440747 | Boston | Joseph P Manning | 3 |
| VA | 1070747 | Botetourt County | Cloverdale Elementary | 3 |
| MT | 602452 | Bozeman Elem | Longfellow School | 4 |
| CT | 162713 | Bristol School District | Greene-Hills School | 4 |
| IA | 236118 | Burlington CSD | Black Hawk Elementary School | 5 |
| IL | 274873 | CCSD 146 | Memorial Elem School | 5 |
| PA | 897499 | CENTRAL BUCKS SD | DOYLE EL SCH | 4 |
| PA | 904573 | CUMBERLAND VALLEY SD | SILVER SPRING EL SCH | 3 |
| IA | 253051 | Cardinal CSD | Cardinal Elementary Elementary | 3 |
| NV | 1877181 | Carson City | C C Meneley Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 243240 | Cedar Rapids CSD | Madison Elementary School | 3 |
| VA | 1397040 | Chesterfield County | C.C. Wells Elementary | 4 |
| VA | 1071985 | Chesterfield County | Grange Hall Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 2094253 | Chesterfield County | W.W. Gordon Elementary | 4 |
| IL | 11454721 | City of Chicago SD 299 | Prieto Math-Science Elem Sch | 3 |
| CA | 133396 | Cloverdale Unified | Jefferson Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 1826857 | Clovis Unified | Miramonte Elementary | 3 |
| MA | 2046270 | Conway | Conway Grammar | 3 |
| CA | 101238 | Corona-Norco Unified | George Washington Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 4932675 | Corona-Norco Unified | Woodrow Wilson Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 249373 | Council Bluffs CSD | Edison Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 249488 | Council Bluffs CSD | Longfellow Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 68246 | Culver City Unified | El Rincon Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 125739 | Cupertino Union | William Faria Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 139390 | Curtis Creek Elementary | Curtis Creek Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 60048 | Cutten Elementary | Cutten Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 95457 | Cypress Elementary | Frank Vessels Elementary | 4 |
| AZ | 1821027 | Deer Valley Unified District | Sunrise Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 5347267 | Delhi Unified | Harmony Elementary | 3 |
| MA | 416356 | Dennis-Yarmouth | N H Wixon Innovation School | 4 |
| IA | 247777 | Des Moines Independent CSD | Brubaker Elementary School | 3 |

Table 17: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

ST Math is created by
MIND Research Institute
www.mindresearch.org


| State | PID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| IA | 247923 | Des Moines Independent CSD | Hanawalt Elementary | 4 |
| IA | 248343 | Des Moines Independent CSD | Studebaker Elementary School | 5 |
| CA | 101513 | Desert Sands Unified | John F. Kennedy Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 5278757 | Downtown Value | Downtown Value | 3 |
| CA | 4745707 | Dublin Unified | Dublin Elementary | 3 |
| PA | 11150602 | ENVIRONMENTAL CHARTER SCHOOL AT FRICK PARK | ENVIRONMENTAL CHARTER SCHOOL AT FRICK PARK | 3 |
| CO | 153009 | ESTES PARK R-3 | ESTES PARK K-5 SCHOOL | 3 |
| CA | 61298, 116960 | El Centro Elementary, San Francisco Unified | McKinley Elementary | 4, 5 |
| IA | 246888 | Emmetsburg CSD | Emmetsburg Middle School | 5 |
| CA | 111037 | Escondido Union | Juniper Elementary | 5 |
| IN | 354655 | Evansville Vanderburgh School Corp | Stringtown Elementary School | 4 |
| MO | 575237 | FAIR PLAY R-II | FAIR PLAY ELEM. | 5 |
| GA | 207777 | FIRST DISTRICT | ELLIS ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| VA | 1528263 | Fairfax County | Kings Glen Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 111180 | Fallbrook Union Elementary | La Paloma Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 4871954 | Fallbrook Union Elementary | William H. Frazier Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 11071032 | Fauquier County | Greenville Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 4017158 | Fontana Unified | Mango Elementary | 5 |
| MI | 489353 | Forest Park School District | Forest Park School | 5 |
| IA | 254005 | Fort Dodge CSD | Duncombe Elementary School | 3 |
| IA | 254017 | Fort Dodge CSD | Feelhaver Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 2105814 | Fresno Unified | Ayer Elementary | 3 |
| CO | 4746139 | GARFIELD RE-2 | KATHRYN SENOR ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| PA | 901351 | GREAT VALLEY SD | GENERAL WAYNE EL SCH | 3 |
| CA | 96164 | Garden Grove Unified | Enders Elementary | 4 |
| MT | 601214, 600959 | Glendive Elem, Miles City Elem | Lincoln School | 4, 3 |
| MA | 421533 | Gloucester | East Gloucester Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 1808271 | Graettinger-Terril CSD | Graettinger-Terril Elementary School | 5 |
| IL | 300862 | Grayslake CCSD 46 | Prairieview School | 4 |
| IL | 323826 | Grayville CUSD 1 | Wells Elementary School | 5 |
| CA | 4030772 | Greenfield Union | Raffaello Palla Elementary | 4 |
| MS | 598112 | Greenville Public Schools | Weddington Elementary School | 5 |
| MS | 594051 | Greenwood Public School District | Threadgill Elementary School | 3 |
| FL | 10902610 | HILLSBOROUGH | HAMMOND ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| FL | 192603 | HILLSBOROUGH | MITCHELL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 4 |
| TX | 4016087 | HOUSTON ISD | SHADOWBRIAR ELE | 3 |
| CA | 70172 | Hacienda la Puente Unified | Los Altos Elementary | 3 |
| CT | 169486 | Hamden School District | Helen Street School | 5 |
| CA | 5092668, 109254 | Hanford Elementary, San Bernardino City Unified | Lincoln Elementary | 3,5 |
| CA | 4290025 | Harriet Tubman Village Charter | Harriet Tubman Village Charter | 4 |
| IL | 310178 | Havana CUSD 126 | New Central Elem School | 4 |
| NJ, IA | 696635, 241486 | Hawthorne Boro, Newton CSD | Thomas Jefferson Elementary School | 3, 4 |
| MT | 1828611 | Helena Elem | Four Georgians School | 3 |
| MT | 604395 | Helena Elem | Jim Darcy School | 5 |
| MT | 604333 | Helena Elem | Rossiter School | 5 |
| MT | 1551765 | Hellgate Elem | Hellgate El Intermediate | 3 |
| VA | 1076210 | Henrico County | Laburnum Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 4016013 | Henrico County | Shady Grove Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 241761 | lowa City CSD | Helen Lemme Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 241785 | lowa City CSD | Herbert Hoover Elementary School | 5 |
| IA | 4282389 | lowa City CSD | Weber Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 240937 | lowa Valley CSD | lowa Valley Elementary School | 3 |
| NY | 3333686 | JAMESVILLE-DEWITT CENTRAL SCHOOL DISTRICT | TECUMSEH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| CO | 5027314 | JOHNSTOWN-MILLIKEN RE-5J | KNOWLEDGE QUEST ACADEMY | 3 |
| OH | 832841 | Jackson Local | Sauder Elementary School | 3 |

Table 18: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

| State | PID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| UT | 2224733 | Jordan District | Columbia School | 3 |
| UT | 11070777 | Jordan District | Falcon Ridge School | 4 |
| UT | 2176954 | Jordan District | West Jordan School | 5 |
| CA | 131166 | Junction Elementary | Junction Elementary | 3 |
| MO | 1759383 | KINGSTON K-14 | KINGSTON ELEM. | 4 |
| NJ | 691594 | Keyport Boro | Keyport Central School | 4 |
| CA | 58083 | Kings Canyon Joint Unified | Alta Elementary | 4 |
| AZ | 39661 | Kyrene Elementary District | C I Waggoner School | 3 |
| CA | 11129639 | LaVerne Elementary Preparatory Academy | LaVerne Elementary Preparatory Academy | 3 |
| CA | 70940 | Lancaster Elementary | Joshua Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 89109 | Larkspur-Corte Madera | Neil Cummins Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 4034601 | Lincoln Unified | Brookside | 3 |
| NJ | 701606 | Linden City | Number 5 | 5 |
| CA | 1170139 | Lodi Unified | Leroy Nichols Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 124254 | Lompoc Unified | La Canada Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 78332 | Los Angeles Unified | Hart Street Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 77637 | Los Angeles Unified | Hillery T. Broadous Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 76322 | Los Angeles Unified | Ivanhoe Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 77778 | Los Angeles Unified | Knollwood Preparatory Academy | 5 |
| CA | 1835042 | Los Angeles Unified | Latona Avenue Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 74439 | Los Angeles Unified | Marvin Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 74491 | Los Angeles Unified | Playa del Rey Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 5356103 | Los Banos Unified | Lorena Falasco Elementary | 5 |
| VA | 1077745 | Loudoun County | Aldie Elementary | 4 |
| VA | 4368907 | Loudoun County | Sanders Corner Elementary | 5 |
| IA | 243953 | Louisa-Muscatine CSD | Louisa-Muscatine Elementary | 5 |
| PA | 916356 | MANHEIM CENTRAL SD | DOE RUN EL SCH | 3 |
| PA | 4029814 | MANHEIM TOWNSHIP SD | REIDENBAUGH EL SCH | 3 |
| GA | 10014354 | METRO | DEKALB ACADEMY OF TECHNOLOGY AND TH | 5 |
| FL | 185648 | MIAMI-DADE | JOHN G. DUPUIS ELEMENTARY SCHL | 3 |
| FL | 185375 | MIAMI-DADE | NATURAL BRIDGE ELEMENTARY SCHL | 5 |
| PA | 886323 | MOON AREA SD | J.A. ALLARD EL SCH | 4 |
| MA | 431605 | Melrose | Roosevelt | 5 |
| CA | 5278331 | Menifee Union Elementary | Freedom Crest Elementary | 5 |
| NJ | 692122 | Middletown Twp | Leonardo Elementary School | 5 |
| CA | 63416 | Mojave Unified | Mojave Elementary | 3 |
| MT | 602579 | Monforton Elem | Monforton School | 5 |
| CA | 79099 | Monrovia Unified | Monroe Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 4811734 | Moorpark Unified | Walnut Canyon Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 243769 | Mount Vernon CSD | Washington Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 111843 | Mountain Empire Unified | Clover Flat Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 102036 | Murrieta Valley Unified | Murrieta Elementary | 3 |
| NY | 744050 | NEW YORK CITY GEOGRAPHIC DISTRICT \#10 | PS 95 SHEILA MENCHER | 3 |
| NY | 747167 | NEW YORK CITY GEOGRAPHIC DISTRICT \#22 | SCHOOL OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY | 5 |
| NY | 748927 | NEW YORK CITY GEOGRAPHIC DISTRICT \#28 | PS 86 | 5 |
| NY | 749282 | NEW YORK CITY GEOGRAPHIC DISTRICT \#29 | PS 134 HOLLIS | 5 |
| NY | 749177 | NEW YORK CITY GEOGRAPHIC DISTRICT \#29 | PS 34 JOHN HARVARD | 4 |
| MO | 574556 | NEWBURG R-II | NEWBURG ELEM. | 3 |
| MO | 11451509 | NORTH KANSAS CITY 74 | BELL PRAIRIE ELEMENTARY | 4 |
| MO | 587682 | NORWOOD R-I | NORWOOD ELEM. | 5 |
| CA | 93722 | Napa Valley Unified | Napa Valley Language Academy | 3 |
| UT | 1824524 | Nebo District | Art City School | 4 |
| UT | 1067520 | Nebo District | Park View School | 4 |
| VA | 3235424 | New Kent County | George W. Watkins Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 240274 | New London CSD | Clark Elementary School | 3 |

Table 19: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

| State | PID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CA | 5278214 | Newhall | Dr. J. Michael McGrath Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 4364303 | Newhall | Stevenson Ranch Elementary | 3 |
| MA | 419451 | North Attleborough | Falls | 3 |
| IA | 232394 | North Butler CSD | North Butler Elementary | 5 |
| IA | 233300 | North Cedar CSD | North Cedar Lowden Elementary Center | 5 |
| MA | 446674 | Northbridge | W Edward Balmer | 4 |
| CA | 79831 | Norwalk-La Mirada Unified | La Pluma Elementary | 3 |
| NV | 4946614 | Nye | Hafen Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 2176887 | Ontario-Montclair | Howard Elementary | 4 |
| IA | 253116 | Ottumwa CSD | Eisenhower Elementary School | 5 |
| PA | 904121 | PENNCREST SD | SAEGERTOWN EL SCH | 3 |
| FL | 201802 | POLK | FRED G. GARNER ELEMENTARY SCHL | 5 |
| CA | 92704 | Pacific Grove Unified | Robert Down Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 130215 | Pajaro Valley Unified | Alianza Charter | 4 |
| CA | 4014766 | Palm Springs Unified | Bubbling Wells Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 102139 | Palm Springs Unified | Katherine Finchy Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 127854 | Palo Alto Unified | El Carmelo Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 11457072 | Patterson Joint Unified | Walnut Grove Elementary | 5 |
| CT | 174601 | Plainfield School District | Plainfield Memorial School | 4, 5 |
| CA | 136520 | Pleasant Grove Joint Union | Pleasant Grove | 3 |
| CA | 5100784 | Pleasant Valley | La Mariposa | 4 |
| MA | 1822277 | Plymouth | West Elementary | 4 |
| VA | 11070870 | Prince William County | Samuel L. Gravely Jr. Elementary | 5 |
| VA | 1173571 | Prince William County | Signal Hill Elementary | 4 |
| MA | 436306 | Quincy | Charles A Bernazzani Elementary | 4 |
| NY | 733128 | ROCHESTER CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT | SCHOOL 52-FRANK FOWLER DOW | 4 |
| WI | 1140835 | Racine Unified | Wadewitz Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 1168198 | Redding Elementary | Bonny View Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 3327106 | Riverside Unified | Benjamin Franklin Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 3248598 | Riverside Unified | William Howard Taft Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 11925859 | Romoland Elementary | Boulder Ridge Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 11713498 | Rowland Unified | Telesis Academy of Science \& Math | 5 |
| TX | 1034078 | SABINE PASS ISD | SABINE PASS SCH | 3 |
| FL | 5347487 | SEMINOLE | WALKER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| FL | 202430 | ST. JOHNS | JULINGTON CREEK ELEM. SCHOOL | 3 |
| LA | 3008403 | ST. TAMMANY PARISH | MAGNOLIA TRACE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL | 3 |
| CA | 1530175 | Sacramento City Unified | Genevieve Didion | 5 |
| CA | 109113 | San Bernardino City Unified | Cole Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 117160 | San Francisco Unified | Rooftop Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 4429305 | San Francisco Unified | Yu (Alice Fong) Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 81511 | San Gabriel Unified | Coolidge Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 1169673 | San Rafael City Elementary | Glenwood Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 55469 | San Ramon Valley Unified | Rancho Romero Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 4747145 | San Ramon Valley Unified | Tassajara Hills Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 123755 | Santa Maria-Bonita | Bonita Elementary | 4 |
| MA | 423804 | Saugus | Lynnhurst | 4 |
| CA | 81872 | Saugus Union | Rio Vista Elementary | 4 |
| IL | 274055 | Schaumburg CCSD 54 | Neil Armstrong Elem School | 3 |
| VA | 1081722 | Scott County | Yuma Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 138463 | Sequoia Union Elementary | Sequoia Elementary Charter | 5 |
| IA | 254885 | Sioux City CSD | Hunt Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 255009 | Sioux City CSD | Riverside Elementary School | 3 |
| CA | 114405 | Solana Beach Elementary | Skyline Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 130502 | Soquel Union Elementary | Soquel Elementary | 5 |
| IL | 319112 | Springfield SD 186 | Feitshans Elem Sch | 5 |

Table 20: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)

| State | PID | District | School Name | GRADE |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| VA | 4748216 | Stafford County | Winding Creek Elementary | 5 |
| OH | 835544 | Stow-Munroe Falls City School District | Indian Trail Elementary School | 3 |
| PA | 901777 | TREDYFFRIN-EASTTOWN SD | HILLSIDE EL SCH | 3 |
| OH | 10029397 | Talawanda City | Bogan Elementary | 3 |
| AZ | 43985 | Tanque Verde Unified District | Tanque Verde Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 4324080 | Temecula Valley Charter | Temecula Valley Charter | 3 |
| CA | 4874724 | Temecula Valley Unified | Abby Reinke Elementary | 3 |
| UT | 1067001 | Tooele District | West School | 3 |
| CA | 4946107 | Tustin Unified | Red Hill Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 244878 | Twin Cedars CSD | Twin Cedars Elementary School | 4 |
| CA | 109656 | Upland Unified | Sycamore Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 3393040 | Urbandale CSD | Valerius Elementary School | 3 |
| CA | 132885 | Vacaville Unified | Fairmont Charter Elementary | 4 |
| CA | 141276 | Ventura Unified | E. P. Foster Elementary | 3 |
| VA | 1089281 | Virginia Beach City | Linkhorn Park Elementary | 3 |
| PA | 925840 | WISSAHICKON SD | STONY CREEK EL SCH | 5 |
| MA | 436916 | Walpole | Old Post Road | 5 |
| CA | 11133991 | Wasco Union Elementary | Teresa Burke Elementary | 5 |
| NV | 4452742 | Washoe | Donner Springs Elementary School | 5 |
| NV | 713609 | Washoe | Lena Juniper Elementary School | 5 |
| CT | 171374 | Waterbury School District | F. J. Kingsbury School | 3 |
| IA | 231194 | Waterloo CSD | Lowell Elementary School | 4 |
| IA | 231053 | Waterloo CSD | Poyner Elementary | 3 |
| IL | 302169 | Waukegan CUSD 60 | Greenwood Elem School | 3 |
| IA | 231883 | Waverly-Shell Rock CSD | West Cedar Elementary School | 3 |
| UT | 2222814 | Weber District | Farr West School | 3 |
| UT | 1068536 | Weber District | Plain City School | 3 |
| CA | 4486743 | West Contra Costa Unified | Cesar E. Chavez Elementary | 5 |
| CA | 55043 | West Contra Costa Unified | Lake Elementary | 3 |
| CA | 82979 | West Covina Unified | Orangewood Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 236089 | West Delaware County CSD | West Delaware Middle School | 4 |
| IA | 240121 | West Harrison CSD | West Harrison Elementary | 3 |
| IA | 236821 | Western Dubuque CSD | Epworth Elementary School | 5 |
| MA | 3250345 | Weymouth | Frederick C Murphy | 3 |
| OH | 789036 | Wilmington City | Denver Place Elementary School | 4 |
| NY | 782624 | YONKERS CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT | MONTESSORI SCHOOL 27 | 3 |
| PA | 10003202 | YOUNG SCHOLARS OF CENTRAL PA CS | YOUNG SCHOLARS OF CENTRAL PA CS | 3 |
|  |  |  |  | 3 |

Table 21: Matched Control Schools (CTRL Dataset)


[^0]:    ${ }^{1 *}$ statistically significant $\mathrm{p}<0.05$

